

**HUNTERSTON SITE STAKEHOLDER GROUP
SUMMARY OF KEY POINTS FROM THE FIFTY SEVENTH MEETING
HELD ON THURSDAY 3 SEPTEMBER 2020 ONLINE, ZOOM PLATFORM**

Chair's Opening Remarks and Vice Chair Updates and Correspondence

The Chair thanked everyone for joining online to allow a meeting to take place. Concerns and questions from the public on the restart of Reactor 3 had been received. A letter had been received from SEPA advising of a variation to the radioactive substances permit to allow Hunterston B to lawfully receive debris in fuel flasks and return to Sellafield. A question raised by Kenneth Gibson MSP at First Minister's Questions regarding employment and the North Ayrshire economy after Hunterston B stops production in January 2022 and the response from the First Minister can be read in the full Minutes of the meeting. Mr McGhie thanked the management and workforce of both sites for the work being done in a safe manner. Mrs Holmes thanked both sites for keeping the SSG up to date. Skelmorlie Community Council was formally approved as a member of Hunterston SSG.

Actions and Approval of Previous Minutes

The Minutes of the teleconference meeting of 4 June 2020 were approved.

Hunterston A Site Reports

Hunterston A Report – Mr Alastair Walker and Mr Ian Warner

The site's Total Recordable Incident Rate (TRIR) has remained at zero for 73 months. Environmental performance remains strong, with an 'excellent' rating for SEPA on permit compliance in the period. Hunterston A's Care and Maintenance entry date of August 2024 has slipped to September 2027. There is a mix of people working on site and from home. The site expects to be fully operational and back to pre-Covid position by mid-late October 2020. Work continues to progress on End State Strategy Development work and members will be kept informed of progress.

ONR Report – Mr Bill Kings

Mr Kings had been monitoring plans and been on site regarding Covid-19 arrangements which were very good. The team was commended for submitting its periodic safety review on time despite Coronavirus restrictions.

SEPA Report –

Mr Stone was unwell and not present at the meeting.

NDA Report – Mr Jonathan Jenkin and Mr John McNamara

NDA personnel are gradually returning to the office. The NDA is helping Communications Teams facilitate meetings and working on recovery planning such as IT upgrades and reconfiguration of offices. Financial support has been given to supporting communities through Covid-19. The Chairs and Vice Chairs meeting will be held on 18 September. New Chair, Dr Ros Rivaz, is keen to meet stakeholders. The Annual Report and Accounts for 2019/20 has been published. Trawsfynydd has been selected as Lead and Learn site.

Update from Scottish Government – Mr Pat McAuley

Only Mr McAuley and Mr Macdonald are currently in the Radioactive Substances Team due to colleagues being diverted due to Covid-19. Mr Macdonald is leading the review of the Scottish Higher Activity Waste policy and feedback from NDA and RWM is awaited. Mrs Holmes asked about the possibility of a Scottish Sites meeting this year, which Mr McAuley will take back to Scottish Government.

Hunterston B Station Reports

Hunterston B Report – Mr Paul Forrest and Mr Nick Cofield

The first lost time incident in 2.5 years had occurred when an employee slipped on a cleaned floor. Permission for the restart of Reactor 3 on 27 August was good news for the proud workforce. EDF's Board of Directors have agreed an end of generation date of January 2022. Aspirational conversations are taking place with all staff. Covid-19 arrangements have been made to reduce footfall on site and enable social distancing, with additional facilities created. A Scoping Report has been submitted to North Ayrshire Council for the construction of three facilities.

ONR Report – Mr Stuart Fannin and Mr Steve Harrison

Inspections took place using Skype during the period. The Safety Case for the restart of Reactor 4 is currently being assessed. Mr Harrison answered many questions and reassured members on the decision to approve the restart of Reactor 3 for a six month period.

SEPA Report – Mr Keith Hammond

Inspections during the period had been done remotely. After internal review, SEPA determined that a formal public consultation was not required on the variation of the permit to allow the Station to accept radioactive waste in the form of debris that is present in fuel flasks.

Any Other Business

Mrs Callander welcomed feedback on the Zoom meeting.

A number of questions were asked by members and members of the public and further detail on these can be found in the full Minutes of the meeting, available from the Secretariat.

Next Meeting – Thursday 3 December 2020, time and venue / meeting platform to be confirmed.



**HUNTERSTON SITE STAKEHOLDER GROUP
MINUTES OF FIFTY SEVENTH MEETING HELD ON
THURSDAY 3 SEPTEMBER 2020 AT 1.30 PM, ZOOM ONLINE**

Present

Magnox Ltd

Mrs Jill Callander (SSG Secretariat)
Ms Tracy Finn (SSG Secretariat and Communications)
Mr Bill Hamilton (Director of Communications)
Ms Mair Jones (Socio Economic Lead)

Mr Sean Marshall (Magnox Communications)
Mr Andy McDade (Trade Union Rep, Hunterston A)
Ms Johan Milliken (Trade Union Rep, Hunterston A)
Mr Reuben Phillips (EHSS&Q Manager)
Mr Alastair Walker (Site Director)
Mr Ian Warner (Land Quality and Waste Manager)

Community Council Representatives

Mr Drew Cochrane (Largs CC)
Mrs Rita Holmes – SSG Chair (Fairlie CC)
Mr John Lamb (West Kilbride CC)
Mr Graham Wallace (Cumbrae CC)

Scottish Government

Mr David Gurney
Mr Pat McAuley

NDA

Mr Jonathan Jenkin (Stakeholder Lead, Magnox)
Mr John McNamara (Head of Stakeholder Engagement)

In Attendance

Ms Sheila Adams (Minutes)
Ms Clare Baguley (MOP - Member of Public)
Ms Janine Claber (Marick Communications)
Ms Helen Smith (Marick Communications)

Apologies

Ms Lesley Jeffrey (Ayrshire Civil Contingencies Team)
Ms Jane McGeorge (Ayrshire Civil Contingencies Team)
Mr Scott McKenzie (Environmental Health, NAC)
Mr Allan Penman (NHS Ayrshire & Arran Resilience Team)
Mr Kenneth Gibson MSP

EDF (Hunterston B)

Mr Nicholas Cofield
Mr Paul Forrest (Station Director)
Ms Fiona McCall (External Comms Manager)
Mr Stuart McGhie – (Trade Union Rep,
Hunterston B - SSG Vice Chair)

North Ayrshire Council (NAC)

Cllr Robert Barr (Dalry and West Kilbride)
Cllr Todd Ferguson (Dalry and West Kilbride)
Cllr John Glover (Kilwinning)
Cllr Tom Marshall (North Coast & Cumbraes)
Mr Stewart Mackenzie (Environmental
Health)

ONR

Mr Stuart Fannin (Hunterston B)
Mr Steve Harrison (Head of Assessment)
Mr Bill Kings (Hunterston A)

SEPA

Mr Keith Hammond (Hunterston B)

Ms Cyndy Duff (MOP - Member of Public)
Mr Alan Holden (MOP - Member of Public)
Cllr Ian Murdoch (MOP - Member of Public)

Mrs Patricia Gibson MP
Mr Craig Hatton (Chief Executive, NAC)
Ms Melanie Hayes (SEPA)
Mr David Stone (SEPA)
Inspector Alison Wilson

Ms Claber, representing Marick Communications, gave a short presentation on housekeeping rules and guidance for getting the best out of the meeting on the Zoom platform.

1. Chairman's Opening Remarks and Declarations of Interest

Mrs Holmes, Chair, welcomed everyone to the fifty seventh meeting of the Hunterston Site Stakeholder Group and thanked everyone for joining the meeting online to enable a virtual meeting to be held. Mrs Holmes stated that it was unfortunate that Covid 19 had stopped any face to face strategy and planning meetings taking place, other than those done electronically and she felt this had prevented local people being able to take part, particularly with planning.

Mrs Holmes thanked the NDA for allowing members of public to join the meeting. She also thanked Mr Forrest, Ms McCall and Mr Walker for the regular updates and was reassured that both sites care about the welfare of the workforce. The Chair noted the full Agenda for the meeting and particularly looked forward to hearing updates on Hunterston B Station, the NDA's Strategy 4 and the review of the Scottish Government's Higher Activity Waste policy.

The apologies, as listed above, were read out. There were no declarations of interest. Mrs Callander read a note received from Patricia Gibson MP when submitting her apologies: 'Please be assured that I will be raising the importance of supporting the economic transition of the local economy in the Commons in the coming weeks.'

2. Chair and Vice Chair Updates and Correspondence

The Chair noted the email received from Donald Urquhart, ONR, regarding Hunterston B Station's Reactor 3's return to service. Concerns and questions from the public on the restart of Reactor 3 had been received. A letter had been received from SEPA regarding the variation to the radioactive substances permit for Hunterston B Station, allowing it to lawfully receive debris in fuel flasks and return it to Sellafield. The Secretariat had kept Site Stakeholder Group members informed.

Mrs Holmes looked forward to receiving more information on the NDA Chairs and Vice Chairs Meeting, to be held virtually on 18 September 2020. Mr McNamara confirmed that more information and a pre-meeting will be available in advance of the meeting on 18 September.

Mr McGhie formally thanked and appreciated the work being done in a safe manner by the workforce on both sites, especially during Covid, which was echoed by Ms Milliken.

Mrs Callander read the following email from Kenneth Gibson MSP on a question he posed at First Minister's Questions:

'Hunterston B power station, in my constituency, will cease energy production in early 2022. Although defueling will mean that there be no immediate job losses, investment in local green, clean energy is now the priority, not least through delivery of the commitments that were made through the Ayrshire Growth Deal. Realisation of plans to revert the neighbouring Hunterston Port and Resource Centre, with its deepwater port, to include logistics energy research is vital and must be progressed if we are to sustain and then grow North Ayrshire's economy. Will the Scottish Government work in partnership with the United Kingdom Government and North Ayrshire Council to deliver the economic transition of the area, as part of its green new deal?'

The First Minister, Nicola Sturgeon, responded:

'We absolutely will. The decommissioning of Hunterston B power station raises challenges, but it also raises opportunities in relation to our energy mix and community and economic regeneration.'

It is important that we work collaboratively to seize those opportunities. There is a real relevance here to the just transition approach that we are taking. The Ayrshire Growth Deal, which Kenny Gibson mentioned, has a key part to play in that regard. We look forward to working with all partners to ensure that decommissioning is done properly and in a way that has employment and the interests of local communities very much at its heart.'

Mr McGhie questioned the validity of the statement from Mr Kenneth Gibson "there will be no immediate job reductions at Hunterston B station during defueling?"

Mrs Holmes reminded voting members of the request from Skelmorlie Community Council to formally join the Site Stakeholder Group, received in February 2020, which was unable to be decided at the March meeting as it was inquorate. Mrs Holmes proposed approving the request from Skelmorlie Community Council to join the Site Stakeholder Group. Mr McGhie noted that there was a vacancy due to Saltcoats Community Council being disestablished and, in any event, was happy to second this proposal.

- **Action – Mrs Callander to formally advise Skelmorlie Community Council of approval of its application to formally join Hunterston Site Stakeholder Group.**

3. Actions and Approval of Previous Minutes

The Minutes of the teleconference meeting of 4 June 2020 were proposed for approval by Mr John Lamb and seconded by Mrs Rita Holmes.

The only action from the previous meeting was on Jonathan Jenkin, NDA, to provide an update on progress and funding awarded to Kilwinning College. Mr Jenkin advised that he is pleased with the progress being made although this had understandably been delayed by Covid-19 and completion was expected in December 2021. The first tranche of funding of £250k had been drawn down and he expected to find out soon when the second £250k would be drawn down.

4. Hunterston A Site Reports

Hunterston A Reports – Mr Alastair Walker

Mr Walker supplemented the written report provided in advance of the meeting by providing a flavour of the last six months covering Site News, Care and Maintenance Programme and Return to Work Programme. Mr Walker had taken over as Site Director following Mr John Grierson's appointment as Nuclear Operations Director for Magnox.

Mr Walker was pleased with the overall site performance. There had been a reduced workforce since 23 March 2020 but safety performance had been maintained and it was now 73 months since the last Lost Time Accident, with the Total Recordable Incident Rate remaining at zero. The Target Zero Safety Campaign continues. Current themes are Mental Health, Covid-19 precautions and Focussed Minds. Environmental performance remains strong, with an 'excellent' rating from SEPA in the period on permit compliance. Accident and Emergency arrangements are in the process of being changed with independent and regular assessments. This involves removal of duty controller during silent hours and is expected to be implemented in 2021. Magnox Executive Team has remained focussed and visible, with the EHSS&Q Director visiting the site and Chief Operating Officer, Paul Winkle, on site in July 2020.

The site's £35M budget for this year was not expected to change due to Covid-19. The NDA had selected Trawsfynydd as the 'lead and learn' site in respect of Accelerated Decommissioning and each site would have a site-specific strategy. Hunterston A's Care and Maintenance entry date of August 2024 is reviewed monthly and forecast to slip to September 2027. 163 people are currently

working on site, which has increased since June.

There is a mix of people working from home or on site as it is not feasible for all staff to work from home. The majority of facilities have now been brought back to work and a considerable amount of work was done to make the site safe in terms of Covid-19. The site expects its plant to be fully operational and back to pre-Covid position and operations by mid-late October 2020.

Mr Ian Warner advised that work is still progressing on End State Strategy Development work despite Covid-19. A paper on Hunterston A will be presented to the NDA's Senior Strategy Committee soon and Mr Warner undertook to keep members informed of developments. Mrs Holmes congratulated Trawsfynydd on being selected as the Lead and Learn site for Accelerated Decommissioning. She had hoped that this would be Hunterston but hoped that there would be future opportunities for Hunterston which would enhance local job provision.

Question and Answer Session

Mr Lamb asked about the weather envelope and risk based deplanting in terms of the strategic review. If this is on hold, he asked about the time limit on the planning application for the weather envelope. Mr Walker responded that an extension to the project has been agreed with North Ayrshire Council. The physical implementation is on hold and is expected to restart in April 2021. In the meantime, the contract works are being retendered.

Mrs Holmes asked if Intermediate Level Waste encapsulation storage would still be completed by 2025. Mr Walker replied that latest dates suggest that this will now be September 2027. Mrs Holmes asked if the site is definitely planning to grout all waste already in store. Mr Walker confirmed that this is the intention currently but what happens will depend on the new strategy.

Mrs Holmes noted that sludge remnant recovery had been delayed due to Covid-19 and asked if anything else had been affected, which Mr Walker advised was not the case. Mrs Holmes asked how gaseous discharges are measured. Mr Phillips advised that samples are taken from vessels and analysed monthly.

Mrs Holmes formally welcomed Mr Walker to his position and congratulated Mr John Grierson on his appointment as Nuclear Operations Director.

SEPA Report

Mrs Holmes noted that the SEPA report had been circulated with the meeting papers but Mr Stone was not present due to illness. Mr Hammond offered to take back any questions he was unable to answer.

ONR Report – Mr Bill Kings

The ONR report, provided in advance of the meeting, was taken as read. Mr Kings had been monitoring plans and had been on site regarding Covid-19 arrangements, which were very good. Hunterston A site had submitted its periodic safety review on time despite Coronavirus and Mr Kings commended the team for this.

5. NDA Reports – Mr Jonathan Jenkin, Mr John McNamara

Mr Jenkin was unable to hear on his connection and Mr McNamara gave the NDA update. Since July NDA personnel have been gradually returning to the office and the goal now is for more regular face to face meetings. The NDA is helping Communications Teams facilitate meetings. A new team within the NDA is working on recovery planning such as use and configuration of offices and IT and software upgrades. The NDA continues to engage with NGOs and hold regular

meetings with Local Authorities.

Preparations are being made for the NDA Chairs and Vice Chairs meeting on 18 September, which David Peattie, Chief Executive Officer, and the new NDA Chair, Dr Ros Rivaz, will attend. Dr Rivaz is keen to meet stakeholders and the NDA will facilitate meetings with sites and Site Stakeholder Groups. The NDA has published its Annual Report and Accounts for 2019/20. Mr McNamara confirmed that Trawsfynydd has been selected as Lead and Learn Site and the NDA will engage with stakeholders over the next 12-18 months to pinpoint strategies for each Magnox site. In terms of community resilience, a lot of effort and financial support has gone into supporting communities throughout Covid-19. This will inform the approach to socio economics in the mid-longer term. The NDA Strategy 4 was published in March 2020 but is now being reviewed in light of Covid-19. The application process for funding has been more streamlined and standardised. The NDA is supporting good applications from North Ayrshire, such as Kilwinning College already mentioned, Garnock Valley and Loch Shore Development. The NDA is happy to speak to communities regarding potential projects. Feedback from stakeholders has been positive on engagement but there is always room for improvement. There has been some criticism of demarcation and clarification required on who does what and further work to be done on diversity which will be followed up, but the general consensus was that the NDA is doing a good job.

6. Update from Scottish Government – Mr Pat McAuley

The Scottish Government report was circulated with the meeting papers. Mr McAuley advised that there is currently only Mr Martin Macdonald and himself in the Radioactive Substances Team due to colleagues being diverted as a result of Covid-19. Similarly some BEIS colleagues have been redeployed due to Covid-19 and as such the BEIS policy review on radioactive substances and nuclear decommissioning has been delayed but a meeting is to be held with the UK Government in the next week. Mr Macdonald is leading on the review of the Scottish Higher Activity Waste policy and is awaiting feedback from the NDA and RWM. Roseanna Cunningham MSP is not standing for re-election next year so there will be a new Cabinet Secretary.

Question and Answer Session

Mrs Holmes commented on the consultation on the position paper regarding 'near surface, near site' and the suggestion that Hunterston may be the recipient of all of Scotland's waste. This would not be welcomed by Mrs Holmes as North Ayrshire is dependent on tourism and she is very interested in the strategies and plans for the future. Mr McAuley was understanding of this viewpoint but was unable to provide a current update and will keep the Site Stakeholder Group informed of any developments.

Mrs Holmes asked if there were any plans to hold a Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting, which should take place in October. Mr McAuley advised that the Scottish Government is limited in terms of technology and unable to use the Zoom platform but undertook to take this up with Don McGillivray, Deputy Director, Environmental Quality and Circular Economy.

Action – Mr McAuley to take back question of Scottish Government hosting a Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting this year.

Mr McGhie asked the NDA the timescale for Hunterston B in respect of ongoing defueling and deconstruction work. Mr McNamara responded that discussions between BEIS and EDF are ongoing but this area of work is not yet underpinned by Government Policy and therefore he was unable to answer this question at the present time. The NDA will be more involved going forward once Government policy is in place to cover the process. Mr McGhie welcomed more information at the appropriate time.

7. Hunterston B Station Reports

Hunterston B Report – Mr Paul Forrest, Mr Nick Cofield

The Hunterston B Station report, issued with the meeting papers, was taken as read. Mr Forrest was disappointed to report a lost time incident for the first time in over 2.5 years when an Occupational Health Nurse had slipped on a cleaned floor and damaged their knee. The site was stood down for a focus on safety performance and awareness of surroundings. Permission for the restart of Reactor 3 was good news for the proud workforce. EDF's Board of Directors have decided on an end of generation date of January 2022 at the latest, which gives some certainty, and was communicated to staff by Skype to keep them informed. Aspirational conversations were held with staff last year and these will be repeated on a one-to-one basis over the next couple of months. Protocol Agreements are in place with eight other stations similar to Hunterston. Torness in East Lothian is a possible option or the brand new power plant at Hinkley Point C. The station has dealt with Covid-19 arrangements well, with a 50/50 working arrangement in place from the start of lockdown, with staff working one week on, one week off, to reduce footfall on site and enable social distancing. Additional facilities have been created, such as showering, messing facility, hand washing, perspex screens and office reconfiguration.

Mr Cofield reported that a Planning Process Briefing Note had been circulated relating to the construction of three facilities on the north of the site, inside the security fence. A Scoping Report will be submitted to North Ayrshire Council for two waste processing facilities (operational waste processing facility and decommissioning waste processing facility) and an Intermediate Level Waste store. There will be a public consultation period early in 2021 with a formal planning application submitted in mid-2021. For further information, members should email Fiona McCall, External Communications Manager.

ONR Report – Mr Stuart Fannin, Mr Steve Harrison

Permission to restart Reactor 3 was given on 27 August 2020. There were no site visits between April – June but inspections continued using Skype. This is quite effective but it takes longer and plant cannot be inspected. ONR worked with internal regulators. Routine inspections of transport and organisational change received a green rating. A systems-based inspection of reactor shutdown systems achieved an amber grading, resulting in a first stage enforcement letter detailing the shortfall and specific improvements required. The issue related to the safety case for the operation of control rod mechanisms and clarification was required as to whether the control rod drive rate of 10mms⁻¹ was a safety limit and condition and therefore have operating rule status which has to be demonstrably complied with. ONR was satisfied that EDF demonstrated that requirements were operating correctly and formally applying the rules.

Mr Harrison confirmed that ONR had given EDF permission to operate Reactor 3 for a six-month period, beyond which any operation would be subject to a new safety case and further inspection and assessment. ONR is currently assessing the safety case for Reactor 4, which is similar to Reactor 3. Mr Harrison assured members that the assessment process was very rigorous, carried out by a multi-disciplinary team of Inspectors, who requested significant additional information throughout the process. The main focus of the assessment was to ensure that the core state was understood and that EDF demonstrated sufficient safety margins between the core state and the Currently Established Damage Tolerance Level (CEDTL). The ONR's priority is safety and it took 2.5 years to reach a decision, which involved multiple levels of review and Heads of Specialisms. Mr Harrison reassured members that ONR would not allow the Station to operate the Reactor unless it was safe to do so. ONR had published summary reports and detailed reports were expected to be published on 24 September 2020.

SEPA Report – Mr Keith Hammond

The written report from SEPA was taken as read. Inspections had been limited to remote inspections due to Covid restrictions, which had been an interesting learning experience. SEPA had participated in a teleconference with EDF, ONR and the Environment Agency. An application from EDF had been received by SEPA requesting variation of the permit to allow Hunterston B Station to accept radioactive waste in the form of debris that is present in fuel flasks. After internal review, SEPA has determined that a formal public consultation is not required but issued a letter on this subject the Site Stakeholder Group.

Question and Answer Session

Cllr Marshall clarified that he is Chair of North Ayrshire Council's Planning Committee and that meetings have been taking place using the Microsoft Teams platform. By the end of September, members of the public should be able to access Planning Committee meetings remotely.

Cllr Marshall asked what support would be available for Hunterston B staff who are unable to secure alternative employment or retire. Mr Forrest responded that there would be no staff redundancies until the end of generation in late 2021/early 2022. He expected 75% of the workforce to be retained throughout defueling. Informing and meaningful discussions will take place with staff on a one-to-one basis.

Mr Lamb asked Mr Forrest about the planning application for demolition of three separate sites and asked if one of these was the admin building. Mr Cofield responded and clarified that this was considered to retain some flexibility.

Mr Lamb asked Mr Fannin if the boiler tube failure probabilities related to reduced pressure in the system due to boiler tube failures a few years ago. Mr Fannin responded that this was not specifically related but progression of microscopic cracks in boiler tubes. ONR makes sure that a robust safety case is in place and looked at safety case revisions. ONR Inspectors were satisfied that this had been accounted for appropriately and with robust response procedures. Mr Fannin pointed out that boiler tube failures is not an uncommon event.

Mr Wallace commented that the fact that Reactor 3 is only permitted to operate for a six-month period after such a lengthy, detailed and intense assessment causes concern and asked if further shutdown and assessment would be required after six months. Mr Harrison confirmed that the Safety Case received was for a six-month period of operation and that is all that can be processed. ONR expects to receive a further Safety Case from EDF later this year.

Ms Milliken referred to the impacts of Covid-19 and the announcement of Hunterston B's end of generation date and asked what arrangements have been put in place for the mental wellbeing of the workforce. Mr Forrest replied that whilst there was anxiety at start of the Covid lockdown, moving to a split 50/50 working arrangement helped staff and reduced footfall on site. In addition, the company has a dedicated website to help staff and this includes training courses. Mr McDade and Ms Milliken agreed that information on mental health should be shared across both sites.

Cllr Murdoch (MOP) noted that the safety case refers to rods being taken freely in and out and freely operated in reaction to an emergency, should it occur, and asked what steps are being taken to ensure that it will not occur. Mr Forrest explained that EDF was required to demonstrate, with a large margin, the reaction to extreme seismic events. As a Civil Engineer, Mr Forrest was



confident that EDF had demonstrated that under different scenarios all rods could be dropped in, with significant margins. Mr Harrison added that the ONR's assessment is based on assessing margins.

Cllr Murdoch (MOP) noted that the graphite core cracks are increasing and the plant has not been operational for 2.5 years now and asked if it is possible that graphite can fragment without a seismic event occurring which would block the rods going in. Mr Forrest responded that this had been looked at in detail and the rods will not be impeded by graphite. He reiterated that there are large margins of confidence in a severe seismic event. Mr Harrison confirmed that there is no possibility of collapse from just sitting there.

Ms Baguley (MOP) referred to the impact on dredging and radioactivity in sediments and asked if there could potentially be radioactive waste in sediments and radionuclides from Sellafield. She asked how SEPA is making sure that effective communication channels are in place. Mr Hammond replied that the marine environment is within SEPA's remit. The site has a licence to discharge lawfully but it is likely that an Environmental Impact Assessment would include a requirement for more sampling.

Mrs Holmes asked why Sellafield is not able to send its flasks to Hunterston clean. If SEPA does not see this as problematic she asked if EDF can offer reassurance that radioactive waste cannot be brought in from outwith the site. Mr Hammond clarified that debris does not come out of the flask and causes no increase in discharges to the environment or to the site's holding.

Mrs Holmes asked about training on simulators for Control Room staff. Mr Forrest replied that simulator training has been done at the station since first developed. Consideration has been given to how to do this safely during Covid and recommended that this is done by introducing social distancing. Mr Fannin added that ONR had been on site on 20-22 July and observed an exercise which was very robust and challenging and which the team performed very well.

Mrs Holmes read out an email from Mr Ian Dippie, co-opted member of Largs Community Council: 'Given that Hunterston B have obtained approval for restart of Reactor 3 perhaps the SSG could elicit comment from the ONR on what I have supposed below. No matter how it is dressed up, I would suggest that restarting Reactor 3 in particular is primarily to determine how much further the graphite bricks deteriorate in the next six months and possibly over a twelve month operational period if a second restart is allowed. The data on level of deterioration over these runs will be used to qualify or otherwise the modelling carried out in support of the case for restart. In effect using Hunterston to run as a test bed to determine how accurate the modelling is so that it can be applied to the other newer AGR's in EDF's fleet in the future. Otherwise, if the station is now not fit to run for its full extended life why is it fit to run at all? I should say that I have been, in the past, a long time supporter of nuclear power but trying to squeeze in a few more bob out of a geriatric station, now more than 40% beyond its design life expectancy of 30 years, with all that implies if something does go wrong beggars belief.' Mr Harrison pointed out that ONR has a legal duty to assess the safety case, which it did and concluded that it was safe to restart. Each case is independently assessed and is not a test bed for other reactors as reactors are differently designed. ONR can only assess the safety case provided. It is believed that EDF intends to submit a safety case for a further six months of operation. It was EDF's decision to announce the end of generation date of the Station. Mr Forrest added that the end of generation decision was made to take control and inform staff as staff require some certainty.

Mrs Holmes recalled that the operational allowance used to be 350, which was increased to 700. In the interim period, one of the reactors was observed at over 350 and she asked if this made it non-compliant. Mr Harrison explained that EDF introduced the operational allowance into its safety cases, which was removed from the current safety case but this does not make a difference to

ONR. Reactor 3 was over its operational allowance but was not over the legal limit so it was not non-compliant and still remained within a healthy margin of the CEDTL.

The removal of the operational allowance is explained in the assessment report and is not an issue for ONR as it was never a legal limit. EDF looked at this differently for this safety case and demonstrated a significant margin.

Mrs Holmes referred to a meeting in which Dr Bramwell was asked if he considered 1,000 to be an acceptable operating allowance and he had responded no. Mrs Holmes asked if the ONR expected the cracks to go above 700. Mr Harrison replied that predictions are included with a 99.9% confidence level. He recapped that it is not the number of singly cracked bricks which is relevant but when the cracks open and there are far fewer of those. Mrs Holmes argued that single cracks are important because they will eventually open and some cracks are 0.5 inch wide. Mr Harrison explained that this information is taken into account during assessments. Cracks open very slowly and the potential for doubly cracked bricks is more important to ONR than singly cracked bricks.

Mrs Holmes observed that it took 2.5 years and £2M to produce a safety case for the restart of Reactor 3 and while she personally does not believe that it should have restarted, she pointed out that this view is not reflective of her faith in the management and staff of the Station. She did not believe it necessary to restart production when demand is low and BEIS has asked two Stations to reduce production. She noted that Barry Marsden, a foremost graphite expert, had said that given enough time and money a safety case can be made. Mrs Holmes recognised that complicated formulae and algorithms were used to reach the conclusion that restarting is safe and she hopes that EDF and ONR are correct in their assessments and it is an uneventful six months. It was stressed that the Site Stakeholder Group welcomes more input on project assessments so that it can better understand. Mr Forrest was happy to engage more with regard to modelling. He reiterated that it is for EDF to demonstrate and furnish ONR with a safety case, which is scrutinised by internal experts and regulators who are fiercely independent. Mr Harrison was also happy to engage and explain further and agreed that it is very complex, which is the reason that it takes so long to assess. It is difficult to explain to non-experienced people but he reiterated that the ONR is satisfied that the reactor is safe to operate with a robust safety case and wide margins.

Regardless of personal individual opinion, Mr McGhie asked that the Site Stakeholder Group recognised the achievements and professionalism of staff, management and the ONR and the dedication and hard work at the Station for 40 years. Cllr Ferguson seconded this sentiment.

Cllr Barr noted that the meeting had run over the allocated two hours and felt it is difficult to maintain concentration after two hours. He personally did not like meetings on Zoom.

Mr McDade noted that Zoom is currently the only way to hold a Site Stakeholder Group meeting and while face to face meetings are preferable, until this is possible Zoom is a good compromise as it is important that the meetings take place.

Mr Wallace asked if the reactor has to be shut down and a new safety case submitted at the end of the six months or if the permission can be renewed. If the former is the case, why did EDF not apply for twelve month's operation. Mr Forrest responded that a six-month period was requested to give confidence in inspections. During the six months, the next Safety Case will be written. Mr Harrison added that new analysis will be required with the next Safety Case.

Cllr Murdoch (MOP) referred to a press statement by Cllr Ferguson stating that the Station should be closed now for various safety concerns, not questioning the workforce. Cllr Murdoch (MOP) was concerned about the implications of Covid getting a grip of the workforce and what would



happen in this case as the staff cannot be easily or quickly replaced. Cllr Murdoch (MOP) also asked what the legal operational limit is and if there is not one, how far is too far. He disagreed that EDF is ceasing generation two years early and argued that this is 15 years after end of life.

Mr Forrest replied that staff are used to following rules and avoiding hazards. Various measures are in place to minimise the risk of Covid, including segregated shifts, hand washing and social distancing. On Cllr Murdoch's (MOP) second point, Mr Forrest was confident that the safety case provides large margins and is confident that the next safety case will also demonstrate that it can cover seismic events. Mr Harrison added that the ONR will need to be convinced that the CEDTL is robust with large margins.

Mr Holden (MOP) supported Mr McGhie's comments about the workforce and noted that the cracking is not new and has been being monitored for years. He is reassured by the amount of time and money invested in writing safety cases. The Station has been evolving for years, with modified and upgraded plant over the years. As a local resident, Mr Holden (MOP) supported continued operation.

Cllr Marshall took issue with Cllr Murdoch (MOP) bringing up the Conservative party into the meeting. He clarified what was written in the press and that Cllr Murdoch (MOP) is not a member of the Site Stakeholder Group. Cllr Barr pointed out that politics should not arise in Site Stakeholder Group meetings.

8. Any Other Business

Mrs Callander welcomed any feedback on the Zoom meeting and would try to find ways to improve on this in future.

9. Next Meeting – Thursday 3 December 2020

The date of the next meeting was confirmed as Thursday 3 December 2020.

The Chair thanked everyone for participating in the meeting, which closed at 3.50 pm.