

**HUNTERSTON SITE STAKEHOLDER GROUP
SUMMARY OF KEY POINTS FROM THE FIFTY SECOND MEETING
HELD ON THURSDAY 6 DECEMBER 2018 AT THE SEAMILL HYDRO, 39 ARDROSSAN ROAD, SEAMILL**

Chairman's Opening Remarks

Mrs Rita Holmes, Chair, welcomed everyone to the meeting. Members sent their good wishes to Cllr John Glover who is currently in hospital.

Chair and Vice Chair Updates and Correspondence

The Chair summarised several meetings that she had attended on behalf of the SSG and also meetings that she had attended as an interested member of the public. There was lengthy discussion around an alleged statement from Mrs Holmes in the Largs and Millport News on the closed Reactor 3 at Hunterston B Station. Mrs Holmes clarified that this was not a direct quote and was a personal view. A formal motion was proposed and seconded for a press statement to be issued in support of EDF and Hunterston B Station. This will be drafted and agreed and issued by voting members and not through the Secretariat. Mrs Holmes will speak to the newspaper regarding clarification of her alleged statement.

Actions and Approval of Previous Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting of 6 September 2018 were approved. The two actions from the meeting were discharged.

Hunterston A Site Reports

Hunterston A Report – Mr Alastair Walker (on behalf of Mr John Grierson)

The site's Total Recordable Incident Rate (TRIR) and the Day Away Case Rate (DACR) remains at zero. The annual Safety Review meeting with Regulators took place at Chapelcross with regulators being satisfied with both sites. Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme, addressed staff at a site stand-down to explain the new contract position. The revised structure for shift operations teams is now in place. Photos were shown of major milestones on site.

ONR Report – Mr Bill Kings

Mr Kings introduced himself and his background. Three Licence Compliance Inspections had taken place, all with green ratings. Six Systems Based Inspections and a conventional Fire Safety Inspection undertaken also had green ratings.

SEPA Report – Mr David Stone

There had been one inspection to determine that there are adequate resources to ensure that appropriate environmental expertise is available on site, which was deemed adequate, with recommendations for improvement made for ensuring resilience in this area. An application has been submitted by the site in relation to Pollution Prevention and Control.

NDA Report – Mr Bill Hamilton

Bradwell site has entered Care and Maintenance, heralding a major milestone. Sellafield's Thermal Oxide Reprocessing Plant (THORP) has stopped processing. Lawrie Haynes has been appointed Chair Designate of the NDA subsidiary, Magnox Ltd. The NDA's draft Business Plan has been published and is out for consultation until 4 February 2019.

Update from Scottish Government – Mr Ewan Young

The Scottish Government report included updates on Radioactive Contaminated Land; Article 35 Verification Visit; Committee on Radioactive Waste Management (CoRWM) meetings; Scottish Higher Activity Waste Strategy Implementation; Magnox Workshop; Scottish Nuclear Sites Group.

Hunterston B Station Reports

Hunterston B Report – Mr Colin Weir

An interactive App produced by EDF to visually demonstrate the keyway root cracks in context with the whole turbine and reactor building was shown. Reactor 3 remains offline for detailed inspection. The safety case for returning Reactor 4 to service was submitted to ONR on 7 November 2018 for assessment.

ONR Report – Mr Stuart Fannin

Mr Fannin described the inspections on site during the period. He explained the process to be followed prior to Reactor 4 and Reactor 3 being returned to service, the determination of which and the project assessment reports will be available on ONR's website.

SEPA Report – Mr Keith Hammond

Mr Hammond explained inspections in the period. The latest version of Radioactivity in Food and the Environment (RIFE 23) for 2017 has been published and is available on SEPA's website. SEPA's Nuclear Sector Plan is still in draft and will be discussed at a workshop being planned for January 2019, during the consultation period.

Any Other Business

A Sub Group of the SSG will be formed to look at the socio-economic impact in North Ayrshire of Hunterston B closing and agree Terms of Reference with North Ayrshire Council.

A number of questions were asked by members and further detail on these can be found in the full Minutes of the meeting.

Next Meeting – Thursday 7 March 2019 at 1.00 pm for 1.30 pm at The Waterside Hotel, Adrossan Rd, Seamill



**HUNTERSTON SITE STAKEHOLDER GROUP
MINUTES OF FIFTY SECOND MEETING HELD ON
THURSDAY 6 DECEMBER 2018 AT 1.30 PM
AT THE SEAMILL HYDRO, 39 ARDROSSAN ROAD, SEAMILL, KA23 9ND**

Present

Magnox Ltd

Mr Sean Marshall (Magnox Communications)
Mr Andy McDade (Trade Union Rep)
Mr Reuben Phillips (EHSS&Q Manager)
Mr Alastair Walker (Programme Delivery Manager)

EDF (Hunterston B)

Dr Roddy Angus (Technical Support Manager)
Mr Bob Fenton (Head of Communications)
Ms Fiona McCall (External Comms Manager)
Mr Stuart McGhie – SSG Vice Chair (Trade Union Rep)
Mr Colin Weir (Station Director)

Community Council Representatives

Mr Drew Cochrane (Largs CC)
Mrs Rita Holmes – SSG Chair (Fairlie CC)
Mr John Lamb (West Kilbride CC)
Mr Phil Lonsdale (Cumbrae CC)

ONR

Mr Stuart Fannin (Hunterston B)
Mr Bill Kings (Hunterston A)

North Ayrshire Council

Cllr Robert Barr (Dalry and West Kilbride)
Cllr Todd Ferguson (Dalry and West Kilbride)
Cllr Tom Marshall (North Coast and Cumbraes)
Mr Hugh McGhee (Environmental Health)

SEPA

Mr David Stone (Hunterston A)
Mr Keith Hammond (Hunterston B)

NDA

Mr Bill Hamilton

Scottish Government

Mr Ewan Young

In Attendance

Mrs Sheila Adams (Minutes)
F Bowman (Public)
Mr Calum Corral (Largs and Millport News)
Frances Gourlay (Ayrshire Green Party)

Mr Ian Murdoch (North Ayrshire Council)
Mr David Nairn (Clyde Porpoise CIC)
Susanne Proven (Ayrshire Green Party)

Apologies

Mrs Jill Callander (Magnox, SSG Secretariat)
Mr Angus Cochran-Patrick (Hunterston Estate)

Cllr John Glover (North Ayrshire Council, Kilwinning)
Mr John Grierson (Magnox, Scottish Regional Lead)
Ms Jane McGeorge (Ayrshire Civil Contingencies Team)

Mr Allan Rice (Saltcoats CC)
Mr Ian Warner (Magnox, End State Optimisation Manager)

1. Chairman's Opening Remarks and Declarations of Interest

Mrs Holmes, Chair, welcomed everyone to the fifty second meeting of the Hunterston Site Stakeholder Group in the Seamill Hydro Hotel, Seamill. All those present introduced themselves. The apologies, as listed above, were read out. There were no declarations of interest. The Chair asked that all speakers talk clearly and loudly so that everyone in the room could hear.

Cllr Barr advised that Cllr John Glover is currently in intensive care following a heart bypass operation and asked that the best wishes of the Site Stakeholder Group are passed to Cllr Glover.
Action – SSG Secretariat to send the good wishes of Hunterston SSG to Cllr John Glover.

The Chair advised that she had received two questions from members of the public who were not present and these had been passed to Mr Weir and Dr Angus for response.

2. Chair and Vice Chair Updates and Correspondence

The Chair summarised several meetings that she had attended on behalf of the SSG, since the last meeting. These included: Magnox Chairs Annual meeting in London on 19 November; NDA Workshop in London on 28 November on the proposed changes in decommissioning strategy; Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting in Edinburgh on 29 November; monthly meetings with Hunterston A Site Closure Director and Communications and Socio Economics Officer on site updates and socio-economic scheme. Mr John Lamb had also attended the Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting on 29 November as Mr McGhie, Vice Chair, was unable to attend due to work commitments.

As an NGO representative and interested member of the public, Mrs Holmes had also attended the following meetings: BEIS/NGO Forums in London on 19th September and 9 November; ONR/NGO Forum in London on 11 October; NFLA meeting in Kilmarnock on 8 November. Mrs Holmes gave further details on the content of the meetings.

Mr Cochrane asked what Mrs Holmes had gleaned from the NFLA (Nuclear Free Local Authorities) meeting. Mrs Holmes responded that she had attended previous meetings and had not learned anything new at this meeting but an important presentation on the keyway root cracks on Reactor 3 at Hunterston B had been given by Dr Ian Fairlie. Cllr Barr asked if NFLA is a protest group. Mr Hamilton clarified that the aims and objectives of the Group is to achieve nuclear free and local authorities are the core members. North Ayrshire Council had made a political decision not to join and was not a member of NFLA. Cllr Ferguson added that North Ayrshire Council had tried to engage with John Large, independent nuclear engineer, but the cost of his attendance was prohibitive. It was noted that Mr Large had passed away suddenly in November 2018.

The Vice Chair confirmed that he had attended one monthly meeting at Hunterston A site and had missed one due to work commitments but advised that he retires from work at the end of the year. Mr McGhie referred to the first point in the SSG's Code of Conduct, 'respect each person'. He referred to a statement allegedly made by the Chair of the SSG in the Largs and Millport News stating that Reactor 3 at Hunterston B Station should remain closed. As a representative of three Trade Unions, he was concerned that the Chair of the SSG was making public statements without the knowledge or agreement of the other elected representatives of the SSG and requested that there is prior discussion and a consensus reached before press statements are issued. Mr McGhie requested that the Chair of the SSG writes to the local press to either retract the statement or clarify that it was a personal statement and was not representative of the views of SSG members. Mrs Holmes clarified that she had not 'demanded the closure of Reactor 3' which was quoted in the Largs and Millport News.

Mr McGhie conceded that this may have been inaccurate press editorial but considered that a retraction or correction was necessary to alleviate the concerns of staff, their families and the wider community who had seen this and had raised concerns over the alleged statement by the Chair of Hunterston SSG. Mr Cochrane added that he was astonished at a quote from Mrs Holmes on BBC Scotland News, by 'The Ferret' Rob Edwards, that Mrs Holmes was quoted as saying that if safety was EDF's number one priority, then Reactor 3 would remain shut down. Mr Cochrane considered that EDF must have found this frustrating and infuriating.

Mrs Holmes clarified that this was a personal statement and that anyone interested in the keyway root cracks could have attended the NFLA meeting. Mr Cochrane argued that there was not an open invitation to all members. On a point of governance, Mr Marshall advised that only meetings attended on behalf of the Site Stakeholder Group should be reported on. Mrs Holmes clarified that she had reported on the additional meetings attended to declare her interest and for complete transparency.

Cllr Barr and Mr Cochrane added that the Chair of a democratic organisation should not make press statements and should be impartial at all times. Cllr Barr described Mrs Holmes as 'anti-nuclear'. Mrs Holmes argued that nobody round the table is impartial and that this accusation has been made at previous meetings. She confirmed that she respects and appreciates the Regulators and that the role of the SSG is to actively promote and scrutinise decommissioning progress with Hunterston A site and watch and scrutinise the operational activities of Hunterston B station. Mr Marshall clarified that the SSG Constitution, agreed at the last meeting, allowed for all voting members, whether pro or anti-nuclear, to be eligible to be elected Chair. Mrs Holmes had been re-elected following a formal voting process by voting members.

Mr Corral confirmed that it would be made clear in the next week's edition of the Largs and Millport News that the statement from Mrs Holmes was a personal view, to set the record straight.

Cllr Marshall commented that as Chair of North Ayrshire Council's Planning Committee, he must remain totally neutral in all applications and he did not think that Mrs Holmes was neutral or that her views reflected those of the Site Stakeholder Group. He requested that the SSG issue a press statement in support of EDF restarting Reactor 3. Mrs Holmes clarified that this could only be done at a specially convened meeting of all voting members. Cllr Marshall stated that if this was not done at this meeting, he would issue his own statement and it was agreed to discuss further under Any Other Business on the Agenda. Mr McGhie summarised that currently Reactor 3 is off line and staff fully support ONR to complete the Safety Case and that the staff and Trade Unions respect the role of the ONR and its decisions. However, it is upsetting for staff and their families to read in the local press, statements that appear to be coming from the Site Stakeholder Group and this puts him and the elected Councillors in a difficult position.

3. Actions and Approval of Previous Minutes

In the Minutes of 6 September 2018, Mrs Holmes pointed out that Mr Gilchrist was attending as a member of the public and is not a representative of Fairlie and Millport Community Council.

With the above amendment, the Minutes of the meeting of 6 September 2018 were proposed for approval by Cllr Robert Barr and seconded by Mr John Lamb.

Both actions from the previous meeting had been completed: the Secretariat had circulated the NDA Socio Economic Report to members and the Secretariat had produced and circulated a glossary of acronyms to members by email.

The Chair welcomed Mr Alastair Walker, Hunterston A Site Programme Delivery Manager, and thanked him for attending the meeting to present on behalf of Mr John Grierson.

4. Hunterston A Site Reports

Hunterston A Reports – Mr Alastair Walker

Mr Walker showed a number of slides, to complement the written report, circulated with meeting papers.

Safety statistics continue to be very good with the Total Recordable Incident Rate (TRIR) and Day Away Case Rate (DACR) remaining at zero. The last quarter has seen some challenging weather conditions, with storms and high winds causing some minor damage. However, lessons were learned following the ‘Beast from the East’ storm earlier in the year and the damage was not substantial as the site was prepared. The annual Review of Safety meeting with Regulators took place at Chapelcross and both sites received a good report from satisfied regulators. There was a high representation of safety representatives and feedback from the review was very positive.

1. The Company-wide Equality, Diversity and Inclusion initiative continues and a new programme has been well received by staff, contractors and agency workers. Nigel Lowe, NDA Head of Programme, addressed staff at a site stand-down to explain the new contract position and this talk was very well received by the workforce. The consultation to reduce the shift operations teams was completed and the revised structure is now in place. A small number of core personnel working on one of the waste projects have been transitioned onto another project following its completion’

The site’s budget remains at £36.5m. The Critical Path activities are on target for an August 2024 end date. Mr Walker showed a slide of the key milestones on the critical path and advised a key milestone agreed with ONR had been achieved in the period. The Solid Active Waste Bunker Retrieval (SAWBR) project has seen four bunkers worth of materials retrieved safely, with in excess of 900 packages of solid waste recovered and placed in the Intermediate Level Waste (ILW) store, which is working well. The Wet Intermediate Level Waste Retrieval and Encapsulation Plant (WILWREP) has been fully commissioned and handed over to the site. Sixty packages have been retrieved and encapsulated, which is good progress towards starting to reduce hazards. Some issues have arisen with the Solid Intermediate Level Waste (SILWE) project, which are being addressed on site by the Contractor. The temporary weather system around the reactor buildings is being removed. The main Contractor, C Spencer Ltd, is working to resolve complex issues on the design of the access system and work on the weather envelope is now expected to start in March 2019, not January.

Magnox continues to support the local community through its stakeholder engagement and socio-economic scheme. £43,252 has been awarded to community projects, with larger grants going to: Cumbrae Community Gardens; West Kilbride Community Initiative; West Kilbride Village Hall. There are also a number of applications still under review.

Mr Walker finished his presentation by reinforcing the Target Zero Safety Campaign message.

Question and Answer Session

Mr Lonsdale had not been present at the last meeting so did not see the sample cladding for the weather envelope but was disappointed to hear that the cheapest option of silver colour had been selected and assumed that it was too late to change this when the contract had been signed. Mr Walker confirmed that the cladding and colour had been endorsed by the local Planning Department and Mr Phillips advised that the colour is grey, patinated with a dull finish.

Mr Phillips offered to bring a sample to the next meeting and Mr Lonsdale apologised for raising this when it would appear that he had been misinformed.

Referring to the written report, Mrs Holmes asked if the fire doors which were not closing properly were new or old. Mr Walker confirmed that they were old doors and part of an ongoing programme of inspection. The workforce had been asked to be more vigilant and report any doors not closing properly.

Mrs Holmes asked why the Factory Acceptance Testing on the SILWE project remained outstanding. Mr Walker responded that this involves robot computers which are tested to ensure that they are doing what they should but it is easier to test them at the factory prior to coming on site as they are easier to repair in the factory if necessary, rather than on site.

With regard to Risk Based Deplanting, Mrs Holmes asked about the challenges of the Desiccant Dryers. Mr Walker replied that it is necessary to determine the condition of the remaining plant. The options for the desiccant are either to wash and burn or store within suitable containers in the ILW store. Mrs Holmes asked if a map could be provided as part of the next update, showing the layout within the area that encompasses the pond, block houses and scrubbing bay.
Action – Site Closure Director to provide a map of this area in his next update.

Mrs Holmes asked for more information on Phase 1 of the Acid Storage Facility and the Pond Purge Sump project. Mr Walker explained the two projects, which are two separate projects with dedicated teams allocated to them. Mrs Holmes asked if any issues would be sorted out prior to the handover to the next contract model which Mr Walker confirmed would be the case.

Mrs Holmes liked the presentation of the table on page 8 of the report but found it somewhat confusing and asked for clarification on alpha emitting and other radionuclides. Mr Phillips explained that 'all alpha emitting radionuclides not specifically listed taken together' excludes Plutonium due to the number of radionuclides. The list is based on calculations rather than a list of names. Only the primary and prevalent radionuclides are listed. 'All non-alpha emitting radionuclides not specifically listed taken together' in the table relates to everything except Tritium and Caesium, which are listed in the table. Mrs Holmes asked why the dosage is expressed in Man Millisieverts. Mr Fannin responded that this is to give a level of exposure for a collective group. Mr Phillips added that the maximum individual dose is calculated but it is also necessary to know that the collective dose. Mrs Holmes referred to the Carbon-14 'discharges made as a consequence of reactor breathing' and asked the differences in Reactors 1 and 2 as opposed to Reactors 3 and 4. Mr Phillips explained that this relates to atmospheric pressure and it is not possible to differentiate between the different reactors as comparisons are not done on site. Mrs Holmes further asked why there is Tritium from reactor breathing. Mr Phillips explained that contamination samples are taken from the reactor vessel which is breathed out into the atmosphere but not in any force.

ONR Report – Mr Bill Kings

Mrs Holmes welcomed Mr Kings to his first meeting. Mr Kings gave a brief introduction into his background and experience prior to joining the ONR on 1 October 2018. He expanded on the report, issued with the meeting papers, for the period July-September 2018. Three Licence Compliance Inspections had taken place: LC10 Training; LC12 Duly authorised and other suitably qualified and experienced persons; LC14 Safety documentation; all of which had received green ratings. Six Systems Based Inspections had also been undertaken, all of which had also resulted in green ratings. A conventional Fire Safety Inspection undertaken had similarly resulted in a green rating, confirming compliance with the requirements of the Fire (Scotland) Act 2005. There had been no incidents reported during the period. One permission to Licence Instrument 527 in

respect of Emergency Arrangements had been approved.

Mr Kings referred to the scheduled end date of Hunterston A site as August 2024 and advised that consent for Bradwell site to enter Care and Maintenance had been signed last week, heralding a major milestone.

Question and Answer Session

Mrs Holmes asked Mr Fannin if Site Stakeholder Group members are welcome to attend ONR Forum meetings with other NGOs. Mr Fannin confirmed that the ONR actively encourages SSG members to attend these meetings and Mr Hamilton added that webinars are also available for people unable to travel.

SEPA Report – Mr David Stone

Mr Stone apologised for being unable to speak loudly as he had a sore throat and was losing his voice. He also apologised that his report was sent separately to the meeting papers due to it being late. There had been one inspection in the period of the site's Environment Team to determine that there are adequate resources to ensure that appropriate environmental expertise is available on site. The outcome of the inspection was adequate but SEPA recommends that the site looks to ensure resilience as a couple of staff leaving or long-term sick leave could present an issue. He added that this is not specific to Hunterston A site but similar across the Magnox estate and he will speak to Mr Grierson to ensure that there is enough environmental resource on site.

Mr Stone is aware of an upcoming authorisation variation for the SILWE project, which it will not be possible to process within the four month determination period allowed. SEPA will either agree a longer determination period with the site or have all technical discussions on site before the application is submitted. The site currently has an application submitted in relation to Pollution Prevention and Control. This is being determined by the Area Office in Ayr and the outcome should be known by the end of the year. There have been no issues in relation to discharges or incident reporting in the period.

Question and Answer Session

Mr Lamb referred to the draft of SEPA's Nuclear Sector Plan, discussed at the Scottish Sites meeting. Mr Stone confirmed that this will go out to public consultation between 17-21 December for a period of 6-7 weeks and will be published on SEPA's website. SEPA proposes to hold a workshop regarding this in Stirling in January 2019.

5. NDA Report – Mr Bill Hamilton

The NDA report for November 2018 was circulated with the meeting papers and the report for December 2018 was tabled at the meeting. Mr Hamilton highlighted two major milestones in the nuclear civil industry, one of which was Bradwell entering into Care and Maintenance, which is a similar site to Hunterston A. The two reactor buildings are clad in a weather envelope, the ponds complex has been cleaned up and the waste is stored in an Intermediate Level Waste (ILW) store. Everything else has been demolished and cleared and a new security building and fences have been erected. The site will now enter a quiescent state until final decommissioning in 80 years. Bradwell is the first Magnox site to reach this state and this has been the cause of some celebration in the community.

The second milestone is the end of processing at Sellafield's Thermal Oxide Reprocessing Plant (THORP). Another good news story is the draining of one million gallons of water from Hunterston A's spent fuel pond and the removal of over ten tonnes of redundant equipment.

Lawrie Haynes has been appointed Chair Designate of the NDA subsidiary, Magnox Ltd, and is very experienced in both the private and public sector with a strong track record in the nuclear sector. He will formally become Chair of the new Company, Magnox Ltd, on 1 September 2019.

The NDA's draft Business Plan has been published and is out for consultation until 4 February 2019. The Holliday Enquiry is now known as the Magnox Inquiry. The interim report was published and recommendations followed. It is still not known when the final report will be published as some of the former personnel and executives of NDA named in the document have launched legal action.

Question and Answer Session

Mrs Holmes asked for confirmation following the Reactor Dismantling Workshop, that lessons have been learned from Bradwell, being the first Magnox site to enter into Care and Maintenance, and that the NDA will not automatically push the Bradwell solution of leaving a few buildings standing, for all sites. Mr Hamilton confirmed that the process is in the very early stages and there will be further engagement before any decisions are made with bespoke solutions considered for each site.

Mr Cochrane asked if the new management model as of September 2019 would affect the projected closure date of Hunterston A site. Mr Hamilton confirmed that this would not affect the scheduled end date and that a special Transition Team will be delivering detailed briefs to every site. He further clarified that the site has always been owned by the Government and the wages of the workforce have always been paid by the Government. Cavendish Fluor Partnership were contracted to manage the sites and this contract will end on 31 August 2019. Magnox Ltd will manage the sites from 1 September 2019, with new Executives and a new Board. Nigel Lowe from the Transitions Team has already been on site and confirmed that the transition itself will not affect plans, timescales, budgets, or employee terms and conditions.

A gentleman from the public asked what will happen to spent fuel in the future when THORP has gone. Mr Hamilton responded that it will remain in storage in the ponds before going to a Geological Disposal Facility.

6. Update from Scottish Government – Mr Ewan Young

Mr Young's report updated SSG members on Radioactive Contaminated Land; Article 35 Verification Visit; Committee on Radioactive Waste Management (CoRWM) meetings; Scottish Higher Activity Waste Strategy Implementation; Magnox Workshop; Scottish Nuclear Sites Group.

Radioactive Contaminated Land

The Scottish Government's consultation on revised guidance on protecting the public from radioactive contamination in land closed on 21 August. A workshop was held on 10 August, and the Scottish Government is very grateful to all who participated. The outputs of the workshop were considered alongside the formal consultation responses, with no attribution of views to individual workshop participants. There were some very constructive ideas for improving the draft text, in particular on the interaction with development planning, and for other follow-up work that the Scottish Government can commission in order to improve the sourcing, availability and sharing of information on areas of potential contamination.

A final draft of the revised guidance has been submitted for approval by Scottish Ministers, ready for its formal clearance by the Scottish Parliament and then notification to the European

Commission. Formal clearance by Scottish Parliament will be subject to the Parliamentary timetable.

Article 35 Verification Visit – Update Report

Work is progressing on the update report to the visit to Torness in October 2016. Input is being organised by BEIS and the EDF site is formalising its response to the four recommendations made during the visit. This is being considered by SEPA, ONR, Food Standards Scotland (FSS) as well as the Scottish Government. It is hoped to issue the response to the European Commission by 19 December 2018. The closing date for a response to the Commission is 31 December 2018.

Committee on Radioactive Waste Management (CoRWM)

Scottish Government officials met with the Scottish Sub-Group of CoRWM on 7 November 2018. The main item on the agenda was the CoRWM report to the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, Scottish Government focussing on the implications for Scotland following the exiting from the Euratom Treaty. The report will be published subject to agreement by the Cabinet Secretary in due course.

Scottish Government officials attended the CoRWM open plenary meeting in Edinburgh on 8 November 2018. Part of the meeting was a question and answer session with Magnox, Dounreay with inputs from ONR and SEPA.

Scottish Higher Activity Waste Strategy Implementation

Discussions are continuing with the NDA, the NDA subsidiary, Radioactive Waste Management (RWM), and with the Committee on Radioactive Waste Management (CoRWM), on early steps to ensure the effective long-term delivery of the Scottish Government's Higher Activity Waste Implementation Strategy. The Working Group for this work met on Friday 9 November 2018 to discuss how the work was progressing and to identify any obstacles on the horizon. The next meeting will be in early 2019, subject to diary commitments of the members.

Magnox Workshop

Scottish Government officials attended this NDA organised workshop on Wednesday 28 November 2018 in London. The Scottish Government was there as an observer to ensure that Scottish Government policy is recognised and that the views and concerns of Scottish stakeholders are listened to and considered appropriately. The outcome of this independently facilitated workshop is awaited and the next steps regarding stakeholder engagement.

Scottish Nuclear Sites Group

This Group met on Thursday 29 November 2018 in Edinburgh. The meeting received a presentation from SEPA on its forthcoming Nuclear Sector Plan. In addition, there were updates from all the relevant sites including MOD sites at Faslane, Vulcan and Rosyth. The next meeting will be in April 2019.

7. Hunterston B Station Reports

Hunterston B Report – Mr Colin Weir

The Hunterston B Station report, issued with the meeting papers, was taken as read. Mr Weir started his report with safety and was pleased to report that there had been no lost time incidents or injuries in the period, after redoubling the focus on safety. Radiation dose limits are assessed and closely monitored and are well within authorised limits.

Reactor 3 remained offline, with Reactor 4 being taken offline on 3 October 2018 for inspection while the equipment and expertise was already on site. With 495 days of continuous generation, Reactor 4 is considered to be the best performer in the EDF fleet and among the top 10% in the



world for performance. This demonstrates EDF's commitment to investment and training.

The Company and its staff continue to support charitable and worthy causes in the local area with significant financial contributions. The Company is still recruiting due to a predicted number of potential retirees and also has a healthy number of apprentices.

A briefing on the graphite inspection of Reactor 4 was sent to Site Stakeholder Group members. The safety case for returning Reactor 4 to service for four months was sent to ONR on 2 November for assessment. The safety case for Reactor 3 is still to be submitted to ONR but it is expected that an operating period of six months will be applied for.

Mr Bob Fenton gave a demonstration of an interactive App produced by EDF to visually demonstrate the keyway root cracks in context with the whole turbine and reactor building. The app allows for peeling away a level at a time to show each component and allows the user to visualise and understand the size and scale of the turbine and the core, bricks and keyway root cracks. Mr Fenton and Mr Weir described each level and explained what was happening. The app is not available to purchase from an App store but a link to access it can be provided. After the presentation, Site Stakeholder Group members were loaned ipads to enable them to try using the app themselves at the meeting. The advancement of technology over the years and now available had enabled more detailed examination and assessment of the core and the cracks and more accurate models to be made.

Mr Weir confirmed that there had been no damage to the 11 control rod channels inspected this year. He welcomed suggestions from SSG members on how to raise awareness and assured members that EDF would not submit a safety case to return Reactor 3 to service if it did not believe that it was completely safe to do so.

Question and Answer Session

Mr Lamb asked about the seismic parameters and what level on the Richter scale is being predicted. Mr Weir responded that tests are being based on a level of 7.2 on the Richter scale, which is very unlikely on the west coast of Scotland and a 1:10,000 year event. Mr Lamb noted that there had been an earthquake on Arran in 1999, measuring 4 on the Richter scale.

Mr Lonsdale noted that 12 control rods would be required to shut the reactor down and asked how many there are. Mr Weir advised that there are 81 control rods.

Referring to the Graphite Inspection Update in the report, Mrs Holmes asked the difference between 'minimal distortion' of Reactor 3 and 'no significant core distortion' of Reactor 4 and what unit is used to measure this. Mr Weir advised that the unit is millimetres and the measurement is around 4mm, meaning the same for both Reactors.

Mrs Holmes noted that seismic events are often mentioned but not steam or pressure events which are probably more likely than a seismic event, due to the age of the reactors. Mr Weir explained that steam events would affect boiler tube loss and weight loss and this is a different safety case, which has been assessed and is in place. The safety case for this is due to be revisited in 2020.

Mr Cochrane assumed that steam pressure checks must be less intense checks. Mr Weir responded that there has been no boiler tube leaks since 2008. A boiler tube leak would be instantly noticeable as the moisture level around a leaking tube would increase, with action to be taken by operators. He emphasised that stress corrosion cracking which occurred in 2006 has been eliminated by the reduction in power of both reactors.

Mrs Holmes asked where a nitrogen injection had been used previously to successfully shut down a reactor. Mr Weir explained that all stations use this as a secondary shut down system, with control rods being used as the primary shut down system. Nitrogen and the quantity used to hold down a reactor is tested every three years but the Station has never had to use it in an event. Mrs Holmes asked if nitrogen had ever been used anywhere. Mr Weir did not have the answer to this and could only advise on Hunterston B station. He stressed that the nitrogen gas is an absorber which holds and kills off any nuclear reactor but Hunterston B station had never had an event where the control rods had failed to go in. Sea water would also work and other methods are being investigated.

ONR Report – Mr Stuart Fannin

The ONR report, issued with the meeting papers, was taken as read. Mr Fannin described the two routine Compliance Inspections covering Licence Condition 7 (Incidents on Site) and Licence Condition 36 (Organisational Capability), both of which received green ratings. Inspection of Licence Condition 7 showed a good reporting culture and learning from events. Some areas for improvement were highlighted, which had already been identified by the Station itself. Mr Fannin explained that under Licence Condition 36, the Station has to ask for permission to change the size or shape of staffing levels. The inspection showed that the process was understood well on site. Some areas of learning were identified, such as enhancement of justification for changes and greater internal scrutiny.

A Systems Based Inspection on Station Transformers, Grid Systems and Main Electrical Systems was carried out in August 2018, the purpose of which was to ensure that the safety case was clearly articulated, understood and properly set up and maintained. This detailed inspection involved two ONR specialists over two days and was also graded green.

Mr Fannin explained that the Station's reporting of low level, low significance events aids learning and helps prevent more serious issues occurring. ONR was satisfied with the Station's reporting and examples of this are contained within the report. The conclusion of ONR is that Hunterston B Station is a well managed and well operated site.

Mr Fannin confirmed that Mr Weir had written to ONR twice to explain the position with Reactors 3 and 4. He confirmed that ONR was not yet in receipt of the safety case for Reactor 3 but its development is being closely monitored. The safety case for returning Reactor 4 to service after its shut down on 2 October has been received and is being assessed. Mr Fannin explained the ONR's assessment process, in which it has three months to form a view and respond to the site. ONR's role is to independently and critically assess and review any weaknesses in the argument and evidence presented by the site and claims made in support of the safety case. Permission, if granted, is through a formal Licence Instrument and for openness and transparency, ONR also reports on its reasons for approving the safety case, or not, with the project assessment report being published on the ONR website. Mr Fannin further explained Licence Condition 30 and that the process applied for Reactor 4 will be similar for Reactor 3.

Question and Answer Session

Mrs Holmes asked what the ergonomic changes referred to under Licence Condition 7 were. Mr Fannin responded that these related to lines of sight and visibility of control switches.

Mrs Holmes noted that the safety case for Reactor 4 was submitted on 2 November and ONR is allowed three months to determine the application so a response would be forthcoming in February 2019.

SEPA Report – Mr Keith Hammond

The written report from SEPA was taken as read. Mr Hammond highlighted the inspections in the period, which included an inspection of the Station's Environmental Monitoring Programme in September 2018. This inspection resulted in no contraventions being found but a number of actions and areas of improvement identified, which was the same outcome of the inspection of Gaseous Discharges undertaken in November 2018.

The latest version of Radioactivity in Food and the Environment (RIFE 23) for 2017 has been published and is available on SEPA's website. The total dose for the critical group around Hunterston is similar to previous years at 0.023 millisieverts, which is very low and around 2% of the annual dose limit.

SEPA's Nuclear Sector Plan is still in draft and will be discussed at a workshop being planned for January 2019, during the consultation period.

Question and Answer Session

Mrs Holmes was surprised to learn at the Scottish Nuclear Sites meeting that waste does not come within SEPA's Nuclear Sector Plan and will feedback comments directly to Mr Hammond.

Mrs Holmes referred to the last paragraph of the report under Scottish Pollutant Release Inventory (SPRI) and asked what 'queries over non-nuclear parameters' means. Mr Hammond confirmed that this has no significance and is holding text.

A member of the public asked if the reactor shut down system has been regularly tested. Mr Weir confirmed that it had been tested and would not be deployed without first being assessed for safety.

A gentleman in the public gallery asked about the safety case for a seismic event when Reactor 3 is built on a minor fault line and if there had been any problems or defects on the control rods during the lifetime of the Station resulting in any being decommissioned. Mr Weir confirmed that safety in a seismic event is all part of the building and assessment of the safety case and that the rods had never failed but he was unable to confirm other faults.

Cllr Barr asked if both sites have defibrillators on site. Mr Phillips confirmed that Hunterston A has several on site and Mr Weir confirmed that Hunterston B also has several, with nurses on duty 24/7.

8. Any Other Business

Mr McGhie requested that a Sub Group of the Site Stakeholder Group be formed to look at the socio-economic impact in North Ayrshire of Hunterston B closing. Mr McGhie appreciated that management had kept the workforce informed and the intention was not to cause alarm but it was a fact that the Station would close and action needs to be taken now to mitigate the impact of the loss of jobs. Mr Weir asked Hunterston A site to reflect on any lessons learned and feedback to Hunterston B anything that in hindsight could be done differently for Hunterston B Station.

Cllr Marshall agreed that a Socio-Economic Sub Group should be formed. Mrs Holmes noted that a meeting had been held a few years ago with North Ayrshire Council to address this but there had been no further engagement although she believed that Mr Hamilton had recently met with North Ayrshire Council.



Mr Marshall advised that this came under Cllr Gallagher's portfolio and he had undertaken to take this back to North Ayrshire Council on behalf of both sites, looking at the whole Hunterston peninsula. Mrs Holmes added that she had approached North Ayrshire Council before attending the Workshop in London on early decommissioning and Mr Grierson had also supported her with some information for this.

Mr McDade clarified that Hunterston A site will enter Care and Maintenance in 2024 with Hunterston B Station closing in 2023 and agreed that this will have a significant impact on the economy at the same time. Mr McGhie suggested setting the wheels in motion by agreeing Terms of Reference with North Ayrshire Council. Mr McGhie requested that a date is arranged for voting members to have a round-table discussion and Mrs Holmes agreed that the Site Stakeholder Group should be proactive in taking this forward.

Returning to the earlier discussion on press statements, Mrs Holmes considered it to be inappropriate for the Site Stakeholder Group to make a formal statement on Reactor 3 or Reactor 4 prior to a decision being made by the ONR. She reminded members that it is not normal for the Site Stakeholder Group, as an independent body and interface, to make public statements. Mrs Holmes will speak separately to Mr Corral regarding the alleged quote from her.

Cllr Marshall referred to his earlier comments and proposed a formal motion that Hunterston Site Stakeholder Group issues a press statement saying 'Hunterston Site Stakeholder Group has every confidence in EDF and ONR and their staff in the safe and continuing operation of Hunterston B Station'. Mr Marshall clarified that the Site Stakeholder Group is an interface for information sharing and it is not normal practice for motions to be taken at SSG meetings as SSG members are representing others and if a statement is being made, it would have to be from Voting Members only. Mr Marshall further clarified that the SSG Secretariat would not write a Press Release. Mr Cochrane noted that it was not just the Largs and Millport News but also on BBC Scotland News that it was implied that Mrs Holmes was speaking on behalf of the SSG. Mr Cochrane seconded Cllr Marshall's motion, which was agreed by voting members present. Mr Cochrane will draft a press statement and send to all voting members for approval before publication. A gentleman in the public gallery did not consider the motion to be impartial but the Chair asked that there was no further discussion on the subject.

9. Next Meeting – Thursday 7 March 2019

The date of the next meeting was confirmed as Thursday 7 March 2019, at 1.00pm for 1.30pm, at the Waterside Hotel, Ardrossan Road, West Kilbride, KA23 9NG.

The Chair closed the meeting at 4.07 pm by thanking everyone for attending and wishing them all the compliments of the season.