



Chapelcross Site Stakeholder Group

Minutes of the Meeting held on Friday 6th June 2014 at Council Chambers, Annan Town Hall, High Street, Annan

Present:

Cllr Ronnie Ogilvie (representing Annandale South) (Chairman)
Cllr Craig Peacock (representing Annandale East and Eskdale) (Vice Chairman)
Jill Callander (SSG Secretary)
John Grierson (Chapelcross Site Director)
Karen Bratton (EHSS&Q Manager, Magnox Limited)
Cllr Sean Marshall (representing Annandale South)
Cllr Archie Dryburgh (representing Annandale East and Eskdale)
Cllr Stephen Thompson (representing Annandale North)
Bill Hamilton (Nuclear Decommissioning Authority, NDA)
Ewan Young (Scottish Government)
David Stone (SEPA)
Jason Syers (D&G Council, Economic Development, Strategic Projects Manager)
Harry Brown (2km Resident Representative)
Martin Brown (Representative of Federation of Community Councils)
Willie McNairn (2km Resident Representative)
Jim Nesbitt (Representative of Federation of Community Councils)
Ian Park (Chapelcross Union Representative)

Apologies:

Ian Campbell (Dumfries and Galloway Community Fire and Rescue)
Gordon McMiken (Scottish Govt Rural Payments and Inspections Division)
Jon-Paul Dinnon (Scottish Govt Rural Payments and Inspections Division)
Cllr Ian Carruthers (representing Annandale South)
Elaine Murray (MSP)
David Mundell (MP)

In Attendance:

Sheila Adams (Minutes)
Linda Eadie (MoD Submarine Dismantling Project)
Lucy Samuel (MoD Submarine Dismantling Project)
David Collier (MoD Submarine Dismantling Project)
Kelly Duane (Cavendish Fluor Partnership)
Press representative

1. Chairman's Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting.

2. Announcements and Apologies (including Declarations of Interest)

The Secretary gave the Apologies as listed above.

Councillor Marshall confirmed that he is employed by Magnox and was attending the meeting as a Councillor.

Cllr Dryburgh intimated his intention to leave the meeting for half an hour to attend the Commemoration Service for the 70th Anniversary of D-Day.

3. Minutes of Previous Meeting and Matters Arising

The Minutes of the meeting of 28th February 2014 were approved as a true record and proposed as such by Cllr Peacock and seconded by Mr McNairn.

In respect of Action points from the previous meeting:

Jill Callander has liaised with the National Skills Academy for Nuclear (NSAN) and Mr Doug Harrison will attend the September Chapelcross SSG meeting – Action complete.

No expressions of interest or comments were received from SSG members in respect of the MoD Submarine Dismantling Project Stakeholders Event on 9th April – Actions complete.

Letters from Chapelcross SSG in support of Assisted Area Status were sent to: Mr Martin Donnelly, Dept for Business, Innovation and Skills; Rt Hon Vince Cable, Secretary of State for Business; Mr Stephen Henwood, Chairman, NDA and Mr John Clarke, CEO, NDA. Three positive responses have been received and these will be fed into CoReS – Action complete.

Information on the remit and membership of CoReS was provided by Mrs Brown and circulated with the meeting papers – Action complete.

4. Chapelcross Site Director's Report (including update on Magnox Socio-Economic Scheme)

Mr John Grierson presented his report using the attached presentation slides, covering the headings of Site News, Care and Maintenance Programme, Socio Economics, Community and Site Support, Magnox / RSRL Competition and Final Thoughts.

To summarise:

As always, Mr Grierson's presentation started with Safety. An environmental Safety Review had resulted in an amber indicator due to issue relating to a bag of asbestos waste. The site is working closely with SEPA and is undertaking an internal management of waste review. The site had achieved over 500 days with no safety issues. Mr Grierson had attended a Higher Activity Waste Policy meeting along with Scottish Government and SEPA. Presentations were made to the Nuclear Safety and Environment Council which received positive feedback.

Dr Tim Marsh had been brought in to work with staff on psychology and safety to ensure that the site keeps on top of its good safety record and does not become complacent. This is part of a range of improvements implemented across all Magnox sites in response to the Fukushima Report.

At the close of the financial year, site performance was £52m, which was within 0.5 % of the £51.5m budget target showing money was used very efficiently through the year. In terms of delivery performance, all delivery targets set by the client were met. There will be no targets set this year by the client but Chapelcross site will set its own.

Changes in the Lead Team at Chapelcross will see Karen Bratton move to a new post as Infrastructure Manager and Ewan McDonald will replace Karen as EHSS&Q Manager.

Mr Grierson was very pleased to see several businesses assisted through the Beyond CX project being recognised and winning awards in the recent Dumfries & Galloway Business Awards. This demonstrates the positive impact that the BCX Team have had.

Magnox Safety Climate Survey had taken place over 3 weeks from October 2013 during which Magnox staff and Contractors were requested to complete an on-line assessment. The review indicated improvements under Usability, Procedures, Event Performing and Near Misses.

Chapelcross site was delighted to receive its twelfth Gold Medal for safety from RoSPA and its third Presidents Award. The highest accolade for safety, The Sir George Earle Trophy, was presented to Mr Neil Baldwin, Managing Director of Magnox Ltd.

The OCS Group received a Gold Award from RoSPA for its work in the nuclear sector, with most of its work being on the asbestos project on Chapelcross Site..

The Graphite Handling Facility building has now been completely dismantled. The asbestos removal is continuing well but will run down as the financial year progresses. The contract for building supplies for the Electrical Overlay has been let to a local company. Under Ponds remediation, new devices have been deployed to the Ponds. Intermediate Level Waste is being progressed through design and manufacture to enable retrieval and packaging.

At the end of the financial year, £34,380 had been awarded through the Socio Economic Scheme, which was slightly lower than previous years. This year to date £17,710 has been awarded and it is encouraging to see applications coming forward. Mr Grierson was particularly pleased to see Calum Graham receive a presentation from Richard Waite, President of Energy *Solutions* Europe to fund the Sports Academy to the tune of £15K. Mr Grierson had attended the Young Enterprise Scotland Awards and was very impressed by the young people taking part and the businesses they have created.

The preferred bidder of the Magnox / RSRL Competition was announced as Cavendish Fluor Partnership and key personnel have been on site at Chapelcross and will be visiting all Magnox sites during the due diligence period as well as attending key meetings.

Mr Grierson concluded his presentation, as always, by emphasising the importance of safety.

Questions and Observations

Cllr Dryburgh noted that Chapelcross site has a very high level of safety and asked how the site could improve on something which is already high quality. Mr Grierson responded that a Quality Management System (QMS) had developed through generations. There can be frustrations in understanding QMS and the amount of form filling etc. Chapelcross has a different QMS system to the rest of Magnox and Chapelcross' system is being developed so that QMS is the same across all sites.

Cllr Peacock asked how Managers would keep the workforce motivated with no targets identified and how much spare capacity the new Intermediate level Waste (ILW) store would have. Mr Grierson reiterated that Chapelcross had been very successful in delivering the targets set by the NDA and would set its own targets on site to continue this success. The workshop with Dr Tom Marsh addressed this and smaller group workshops will look at this further. Longer term priorities for the site are not as visible and the Lead Team will address this. In terms of Intermediate Level Waste storage, there are a number of mechanisms to create capacity and stores are designed with 15-20% spare capacity.

Cllr Dryburgh asked if Chapelcross site could use Hunterston's ILW storage or if there are other buildings which could be used. Mr Grierson replied that Hunterston currently only accepts its own waste, just as Chapelcross has applied for planning permission to accept Chapelcross waste. This may change in the future but currently stores are not designed to store other sites' waste and there is an engagement and approval process to go through. Cllr Dryburgh asked about hospital waste and was informed by Mr Young that this is within SEPA's remit. With regard to use of other buildings, Mr Grierson thought it unlikely that this would be possible due to the nuclear status of the site and the security restrictions. Cllr Marshall added that Scottish Enterprise had undertaken a Technical Feasibility Study and produced a report which gave ideas for licensed and non-licensed sites. Mr Grierson advised that parts of the site are included in the Local Development Plan but there would be a process to go through.

The Chairman thanked Mr Grierson for his presentation and welcomed the Team from the Ministry of Defence Submarine Dismantling Project.

5. **Submarine Dismantling Project Presentation**

Linda Eadie summarised the aims of the presentation and talked through the slides (attached for reference), before taking questions.

Cllr Dryburgh left the meeting at 10.45 am.

Questions and Observations

Cllr Marshall referred to the Stakeholder Event on 9th April and asked about the final resting place of the submarine waste being in the Geological Disposal Facility (GDF) but there is a different policy in Scotland. Ms Eadie will take that as a question to be included in the consultation process and include confirmation of what the waste will be.

Cllr Marshall pointed out that planning permission will be required for an ILW store and asked if the Scottish Government had the power to call the application in. Ms Eadie confirmed that it does but the Scottish Government Policy may change following the Referendum.

Cllr Marshall noted that the NDA had given consent for Chapelcross site to be shortlisted and asked if the NDA's permission is required throughout the whole process, which Ms Eadie confirmed is the case. Mr Hamilton added that the NDA had given consent for Chapelcross site to go through the process and no further decisions could be made at this stage.

Cllr Marshall had understood from the Stakeholder Event that all five sites selected would go through the process unless there were any 'show stoppers'. He considered that Socio Economics would make the proposals more attractive to the public and asked in what part of the consultation process this would be made clear. Ms Eadie advised that Fact Sheets on Benefits and Planning and Public Consultation documents would be produced. Mr Hamilton added that the NDA has a Programme looking at ILW sites in England and is under pressure to advise communities on benefits but that level of detail cannot be given until further down the line when final sites are selected. Mr Collier added that benefits are not part of the options assessment process.

Cllr Peacock asked if there is an option to select two sites instead of one, bearing in mind that there were bases at either end of the country. Ms Eadie responded that the project aim is to have one recommended site but all aspects would have to be weighed up, including travelling and risks.

Cllr Peacock noted that the population around each site would be different and asked how differing levels of respondents would influence the assessment. Ms Eadie replied that there are assessment criteria and weightings for each question, with the same multiplier for each site.

Cllr Thompson asked how much weighting would be given to deliverability issues. Mr Collier responded that there are several rounds of consultation and numerical assessment of operations. A Cost Benefit Map would be produced and if this is identical for sites, national strategic issues and deliverability would be taken into consideration.

Cllr Marshall pointed out that one of the five shortlisted sites is a commercial entity, which could potentially be lucrative for them and asked about transparency of payments. Ms Eadie confirmed that figures will not be available or published in the consultation papers but costs have to be kept as low as possible.

Cllr Peacock asked for clarification that it was intended to move one reactor per year to store and Ms Eadie confirmed that this was the intention.

Cllr Dryburgh returned to the meeting at 11.15 am.

Cllr Ogilvie asked how a skills base would be maintained. Ms Eadie responded that the MoD was not expecting to undertake special operations and any skills required would be considered as part of the site selection.

Cllr Ogilvie asked why Magnox was not invited to the Stakeholder Workshop and Ms Eadie replied that the MoD is working with Magnox and Magnox is supplying the site data.

Cllr Ogilvie thanked the MoD personnel for the presentation.

6. NDA Reports

Mr Hamilton reported that the new Parent Body Organisation (PBO) is engaging with Magnox and at site level and the process is on track for a successful transition. *Energy Solutions*, an unsuccessful bidder, has lodged a claim for damages to the High Court but it is not related to this process and will not affect the ownership date of 1st September. The 2013 Radioactive Waste Inventory has been published and is available to view on the NDA website. As a result of a software glitch, the NDA website had been taken down for a few days to ensure safety for all its users. This coincided with a new website for the NDA which was launched a few days later and the NDA apologised for the slight interruption to service.

Referring to the RoSPA Awards, Mr Hamilton commented on the fantastic achievement by Magnox Ltd in winning the supreme Safety Award, the Sir George Earle Trophy. Mr John Clarke had written his personal congratulations to Mr Neil Baldwin and Mr Hamilton stressed the importance of this to the NDA and offered his own congratulations to Magnox.

7. Other reports from SSG Bodies - ONR, SEPA, Scottish Government, Emergency Planning, etc.

ONR

Mr Kemp was not present at the meeting but had provided a report which was circulated to Members with the meeting papers in advance of the meeting. There were no questions raised with regard to the report.

SEPA

Mr Stone had provided a report which was circulated to Members with the meeting papers in advance of the meeting. Mr Stone highlighted the main points in the report and there were no questions raised.

Scottish Government

Mr Young reported to the SSG on the following matters:

Scottish Higher Activity Waste Implementation Strategy

The Scottish Government is continuing its work on developing a draft Implementation Strategy for its 2011 Higher Activity Radioactive Waste Policy. The NDA, SEPA, ONR, waste managers and other stakeholders have been engaged in the work as appropriate and work is progressing. The Scottish Government is hoping to consult on a draft strategy in the summer of 2014.

At this stage it is not anticipated that specific waste management options will be identified in the proposed Implementation Strategy. The aim is that it will raise awareness of the future decisions that will be needed to be taken to implement the Policy and will explain what actions need to be taken/completed in future periods.

Naturally Occurring Radioactive Material (NORM) Consultation

This UK wide consultation finished its twelve week consultation period on Thursday 8 May 2014. The consultation received a total of 30 detailed responses from across a wide ranging number of areas involved in NORM.

The majority of responses were from the industry but there were also a number of responses from local authorities as well other interested parties. The responses are now being analysed and considering them in terms of the strategy. Once this has been completed a strategy will be drafted.

As part of the consultation process, it is the Scottish Government's intention to make all non-confidential responses available to the public by 12 June 2014. These will be published on the SG website or hard copies can be requested from the SG Library.

The Scottish Government will also post a summary analysis of the responses by 30 June 2014, which will also be made available to the public, again by the SG website or SG Library.

It is hoped to have the NORM Strategy published by the end of June 2014 subject to Ministerial approval across all four UK Administrations.

Regulatory Reform (Scotland) Act

The Regulatory Reform (Scotland) Act 2014 was passed by the Scottish Parliament on 16 January. The Act will enable the regulation of environmental activities, which are defined in terms of activities capable of causing, or liable to cause, environmental harm, shifting the focus of the regulatory framework from pollution control to environmental harm. It will allow for the implementation of a simpler, proportionate single integrated regulatory framework and enable the integration of the permissioning arrangements of SEPA's four main regimes of water, waste, radioactive waste and pollution prevention and control, and simplify the regulatory procedures.

The Scottish Government are working closely with SEPA to develop the new regulatory framework that will sit under the Act.

The initial stage is the commencement of new court powers, new statutory purpose and small number of new powers for SEPA this year e.g. strengthened powers of entry. This will be then followed by phased implementation of the enforcement framework (2015) then full new framework of environmental protection (2016). As part of this work the requirements of the Radioactive Substances Act 1993 will be incorporated into the new environmental protection framework.

Amongst other provisions, the new Act introduced a General Purpose for SEPA. Creating a statutory purpose formalises what is already current practice for SEPA in terms of their role protecting and improving the environment, and contributing to achieving sustainable economic growth and improving the health and wellbeing of people in Scotland.

The Scottish Government issued a consultation on 12 May 2014 inviting views on the Statutory Guidance on the General Purpose for SEPA and its contribution towards sustainable development.

Questions and Observations

Cllr Ogilvie referred to Cllr Carruthers' concern from the last meeting that SEPA is seen to be a very bureaucratic organisation. Mr Young reiterated that the Bill should enable procedures to be more streamlined so there is less bureaucracy.

8. External Meetings and Invitations

Scottish Government Higher Activity Waste Implementation Project Board Meeting

Cllr Ogilvie advised that he had attended the meeting on 14th March 2014.

MoD Submarine Dismantling Project Meeting

Cllr Ogilvie, Cllr Peacock and Ian Park (CX Union Representative) attended the meeting in Penrith on 9th April on behalf of Chapelcross SSG. Sean Marshall also attended to represent the Magnox Communications Function.

NDA Stakeholder Meeting

Cllr Peacock gave a detailed account of the meeting he had attended with Cllr Ogilvie in Manchester on 22nd April 2014. This was an opportunity for all Stakeholder Steering Groups to meet the new Parent Body Organisation (PBO), Cavendish Fluor. Mr Graham Rankine of the NDA gave a presentation on the final stages of the bidding process and the process which will follow over the next six months. The senior Management Team of the new PBO was introduced and they gave an overview of the structure of the new partnership. SSG representatives had an opportunity to discuss with senior management issues pertinent to their specific sites, which for Chapelcross was moving straight to Care and Maintenance, use of the local supply chain and socio economics. While the PBO was unable to offer commitments at this stage, they were positive and listened to the concerns.

Scottish Sites Meeting

Cllr Marshall reported on the meeting held in Edinburgh on 1st May 2014. A good presentation was received on the changes taking place within SEPA and the consultation process. Mr Greg Black from the University of Manchester, who had attended Chapelcross SSG meeting in December 2013, gave a presentation. An update was given by each of the Scottish sites, with the transfer of Intermediate Level Waste between Torness and Hunterston B dominating discussions.

9. CoReS Update

Mr Jason Syers confirmed that Dumfries and Galloway has been granted Assisted Area Status which is very helpful as CoReS moves forward and will assist inward investment in the east, not in terms of funding but in the ability to maximise leverage. This will play a very important part in the evolution of the Development Framework.

In terms of the delivery of the physical regeneration projects, the improvements to Lockerbie High Street are now fully completed with the next generation of projects in Annan in the pipeline. The Bridge Gateway is almost complete and the Station, whilst having a few glitches along the way, is on target for completion.

The CX project received substantial coverage in DGLife's DG Business magazine in May and the project supported a significant number of businesses which were nominated and won awards. This is a tangible demonstration of the success of the project. Annan Distillery has seen huge investment and this will be a major attraction for the area. CoReS is now moving forward and will capture economic development more widely.

Questions and Observations

Cllr Thompson pointed out that work is not quite complete in Lockerbie and Mr Syers advised that the annual maintenance will take place towards the end of the financial year to give businesses a break from all the road works.

Cllr Dryburgh asked for an update on Gretna. Mr Syers advised that the procurement phase is about to begin and it is hoped to carry out projects this financial year. Cllr Dryburgh noted his thanks to Mr Don Taylor. Cllr Marshall was pleased to see physical evidence of the success of the project and added that much work is being done behind the scenes by Mr Taylor and Mrs Bamford which is making an impact as word is spreading.

10. Any Other Business

Mrs Callander advised members that the Chapelcross SSG papers were available on the NDA website but these are in the process of being moved to the new Magnox website, under 'Community'. Mrs Callander proposed that in an attempt to be more environmentally friendly and save resources in printing and posting papers, she will email a link to all members where they can access the papers online. If anyone does still require a hard copy, they should email or telephone Mrs Callander and copies will be sent to them. She will write to all members advising of this and requesting up-to-date contact details.

Cllr Ogilvie thanked Ms Bratton for her support and input to meetings and wished her well in her new role.

11. Public Forum

There were no comments from the public.

12. Next Meeting – Friday 5th September 2014

The next meeting will be held on Friday 5th September 2014 at 10.00 am in the Council Chambers, Town Hall, Annan.

The Chairman thanked everyone for attending and closed the meeting at 11.55 am.