

HINKLEY POINT SITE STAKEHOLDER GROUP

Minutes of the meeting held at Exchange Conference Centre, Bridgwater
on Friday 26 February 2010

Present

<u>Cllr M Short (Chairman)</u>	-	Fiddington Parish Council
Mr B Hughes	-	Site Director, Hinkley Point A
Mr N Cann	-	Station Director, Hinkley Point B

Elected Members

<u>Ms J Brown</u>	-	Parents Concerned about Hinkley
<u>Cllr M Brown</u>	-	Otterhampton Parish Council
<u>Cllr M Caswell (Vice-Chairman)</u>	-	Stockland Bristol
<u>Mr A Debenham</u>	-	Stop Hinkley
<u>Cllr J Edney</u>	-	Somerset County Council
Cllr A Ensor	-	Nether Stowey Parish Council
Cllr R Garner	-	North Somerset Council
Ms S Goss	-	West Hinkley Action Group
Mr A Jeffrey	-	Stop Hinkley
Cllr N Jones	-	Sedgemoor District Council
<u>Cllr Dr M Kellaway-Marriott</u>	-	North Somerset Council
Cllr S Kingham	-	Sedgemoor District Council
Mr C Knox	-	National Farmers' Union
<u>Cllr C Morgan</u>	-	West Somerset District Council
Cllr Ms A Palmer	-	West Somerset District Council
Mr K ter Braak	-	Friends of Quantock
<u>Cllr P Tipney</u>	-	West Somerset District Council
Cllr J Walker	-	West Somerset District Council
Cllr R Western	-	Wembdon Parish Council
<u>Cllr T Williams</u>	-	Kilve Parish Council
Cllr D Yeomans	-	Somerset County Council
Mr C Aubrey	-	Forum 21
Mr P Phillips	-	Staff Representative
Cllr Mrs P Wride	-	Chair, Berkeley SSG

Appointed Members

Dr D Warner	-	Nuclear Decommissioning Authority
Mr T Howes	-	Civil Nuclear Constabulary
Mr I Bretherton	-	Nuclear Installations Inspectorate
Mr J Burrows	-	Nuclear Installations Inspectorate
Mr D Withey	-	Environment Agency
Mr G McMeekan	-	Environment Agency
Mr S Carey	-	Avon and Somerset Constabulary
Mr A Cohen	-	Avon and Somerset Constabulary
Mr I Hunter	-	Somerset County Council
Ms N Dawson	-	Somerset County Council
Ms A Watts	-	

Co-opted member

Miss B Child - Co-opted Member

British Energy

Mr P Higginson - Technical and Safety Support Manager

Mr G Bell - Public Relations Officer

Mr D Stokes - Human Resources Advisor

Mr B Eyley - Site Inspector

Mr M Speed

Magnox South

Mr S Payne - Communications Officer

Ms J Hellier - Communications Support

Ms G Coombs - Communications Support

Mr R Adcock - Head of Environment

Ms M Yeung

In Attendance

Mr M J Davis - Secretary

Mr R Cudlipp

Members of the sub group are highlighted above in bold and underlined. Appendix 1 shows the full sub group list.

OPEN PUBLIC QUESTION & ANSWER SESSION.

- 1 Cllr Short invited questions from members of the public on any matter which might not otherwise be covered during later discussions on agenda items.
- 2 Mr Cudlipp raised questions in relation to access to the site for the construction of a new station, the potential effects of new overhead lines on health and the uprating of an electricity sub-station in Bridgwater. Cllr Short emphasised that the essential purpose of this Group was to provide a dialogue on matters relating to the operation and decommissioning of the plants at Hinkley Point A and B. He said that the agenda included an opportunity for a brief update on matters relating to new power station development but this was not the forum for detailed discussion on such matters. Mr Stokes undertook to help Mr Cudlipp obtain the information he needed to answer his questions.

CHANGES TO MEMBERSHIP AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

- 3 It was noted that Mr J Burrows had recently been appointed as NII Site Inspector for Hinkley Point B. Cllr Short welcomed Mr Burrows to his first meeting with this Group.
- 4 Apologies for absence were received from Cllr M Hogg, Cllr D Bamsey, Cllr J Edwards, Cllr Ms A Fraser, Mr P Gendle, Ms D Ward, Ms L Miles, Cllr A Trollope-Bellew, Mr C Graham, Cllr B Slade, Mr G Hudd, Mr S Willmott, Cllr T Taylor and Mr C Thompson.

- 5 It was confirmed that a quorum of elected members was present at the meeting.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 30 OCTOBER 2009

(a) Accuracy

- 6 The minutes of the meeting of the Group held on 30 October 2009 were approved as a correct record.

(b) Matters Arising (other than matters to be covered in later discussions)

B Station financial contribution to SSG meetings (para 8 refers)

- 7 Cllr Short the said that this matter had not yet been finally resolved but it was hoped that it would be settled shortly.

Attendance of Observers at Emergency Exercises (para 9 refers)

- 8 It was noted that Cllr Caswell was to attend a Hinkley Point B site emergency exercise as an observer in due course.

Correspondence between the NII and Mrs Brown (para 30(iii) refers)

- 9 It was noted that the NII had not yet replied to the outstanding point in the correspondence from Mrs Brown. Mr Burrows said that he would look into this matter.

Revised Constitution and Code of Practice (para 51 refers)

- 10 It was noted that confirmation of the NDA's acceptance of the revised constitution for the Group had not yet been received.

STATION DIRECTOR'S REPORT – HINKLEY POINT B

- 11 Mr Cann reported on recent performance and current issues at Hinkley Point B, drawing particular attention to the following:
- (i) It was now more than two years since the last lost time accident involving a contractor's member of staff at Hinkley Point B. It was 272 days since the most recent lost time accident involving a power station staff member.
 - (ii) The station had generated more than 1.28 TWh (thousand million units) of electricity during the past four months.
 - (iii) Reactor 4 was currently out of service undergoing a maintenance outage; work was proceeding in line with the plan. Reactor 3 had been shut down during November/December following a fault on the Unit 7 generator transformer. A spare transformer unit had been brought to

the site via Comwich Wharf and the unit returned to service just before Christmas.

- (iv) The station's training processes had received accreditation following a detailed review by a company team.
 - (v) On the day before this meeting the station had successfully completed a demonstration of its emergency arrangements to the satisfaction of the Nuclear Installations Inspectorate. Future training was to focus on search and rescue techniques. The station's security arrangements had been demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Office for Civil Nuclear Security during January.
 - (vi) There were currently 530 full-time British Energy employees, 19 apprentices and 220 full-time contract staff on the site. A further 10 apprentices were to be recruited this year. Lewis Rush, one of the station's apprentices, had won a prestigious National Apprentice of the Year award.
 - (vii) The station had a scheme to encourage car sharing by allocating priority parking spaces to people who shared cars travelling to work.
 - (viii) Station staff had raised more than £13,000 to date for the company's charity of the year, the Multiple Sclerosis Society.
- 12 Cllr Garner suggested that information on electricity production and plant performance should be provided in units which could be readily understood by members and should illustrate the contribution which the station made towards meeting national demand for electricity.
- 13 Mrs Brown drew attention to the reported review of the station's gaseous discharge system and questioned how anyone could be confident that there had been no release of radioactivity off-site following the event reported at the previous meeting. Mr Cann confirmed that there had been no release of activity off site as a result of that event - all potential discharge routes were monitored and levels of radioactivity in the external environment was also monitored. The current upgrading of monitoring equipment was to install more modern plant - the equipment which was being replaced was not unfit for purpose.
- 14 In reply to a question from Mr Debenham on the improvement of shutdown systems, Mr Cann said that options which were being considered included the installation of more articulated control rods and upgrading of the station's nitrogen plant; the review of these options would be completed this year.
- 15 Cllr Dr Kellaway-Marriott said that he represented a coastal ward and was not aware of any adverse health effects arising from the operation of the station. He believed that a comparison of the relative impacts on the environment and health of the various forms of electricity generation would show nuclear in a favourable light. Cllr Walker suggested that the Health and Safety Executive

and the Environment Agency would immediately take action if any discharges represented a danger to the public. Mrs Brown drew attention to a reading list which she had provided some time ago listing various papers on the damaging effects of radiation exposure. Cllr Dr Kellaway-Marriott said that he had studied that list but had found no substantive evidence of adverse health effects.

- 16 Cllr Yeomans was pleased to receive the report of apprentice recruitment. He asked whether actions were being taken to ensure that skilled manpower requirements for construction of a new station could be met from within the County. Mr Cann said that the training and recruitment of the necessary skilled staff was a matter which was being considered by the company's new build team. He was giving consideration to the potential effects of such recruitment on the B Station's requirements for skilled staff.
- 17 Cllr Edney drew attention to the major impact of traffic travelling to the site during the construction of a new power station. Mr Cann said that this was a complex issue which was being addressed within the consultation process. He said that it was relevant also to the existing station staff who would be travelling to the site during the construction period. He said that he personally would like to see a reduction in the volume of road traffic but the various options were being considered.
- 18 Mr Jeffrey referred to a report of discharges of tritium from a closed power station in the USA and asked about levels of tritium discharges from B station. Mr Cann said that all discharges from the site were reported to this Group annually. Mr McMeekan said that all discharges from the site were reported to the Environment Agency and were placed on public register.
- 19 In reply to the a question from Mr Aubrey, Mr Cann said that the station's counter terrorism arrangements were demonstrated in an annual exercise witnessed by the Office for Civil Nuclear Security, the regulatory authority for these matters. These exercises involved the emergency services and other external agencies.

SITE DIRECTOR'S REPORT - HINKLEY POINT A

- 20 Mr Hughes reported on activities at Hinkley Point A Site since the previous meeting, drawing particular attention to the following:
- (i) It was now more than 970 days since the most recent lost time accident on the Site and more than 22 months without a personal contamination event.
 - (ii) The emergency arrangements for the Site had been successfully demonstrated to the satisfaction of the NII in October 2009.
 - (iii) A number of actions were being pursued in relation to the radioactive waste settling tanks discussed at the previous meeting. Actions were in hand to make the secondary containment more robust to improve the

integrity of the storage. Work was being undertaken to characterise the wastes and develop a capability for retrieving the wastes for storage in a new tank structure.

- (iv) Progress was being maintained with the removal of asbestos thermal insulation.
 - (v) Reactor 2 was now "fuel free" following a final despatch of fuel fragments. Work was continuing to verify the "fuel free" status of Reactor 1; a final despatch of fuel fragments would be made later in the year.
 - (vi) Procedures had been established for decontaminating the fuel skips which had been held in the skip store. These procedures were slightly different from those used on the other skips due to the different paint treatment used. Since the previous meeting a shipment of contaminated metal had been sent to the Energy Solutions Bear Creek facility in the USA for melting. A half height ISO container had been sent to the Low Level Waste Repository near Drigg in Cumbria.
 - (vii) Consideration was being given on a company-wide basis to the process for the dissolution of solid intermediate level waste. This included the selection of acid for use within the process. Much of the development work was being carried out at Bradwell and the results of that work would be taken into account in due course in identifying the optimum procedure for use at Hinkley Point.
 - (viii) Consultation was taking place with trades unions on proposals for a revised organisational structure for Magnox South designed to be appropriate for the delivery of future work.
- 21 In response to a question from Ms Goss, Mr Hughes confirmed that the proposals for the treatment of intermediate level wastes related only to wastes arising on the Hinkley Point site.
- 22 Cllr Brown referred to the options assessment process which had concluded that the most appropriate procedure for treatment of solid intermediate level waste was dissolution in carbonic acid. He expressed concern at the implications for storage and handling of bulk materials if nitric acid was to be used instead. Mr Hughes said that the work undertaken at Bradwell would provide information which would help in any future review of proposals for processing wastes at Hinkley Point.
- 23 Cllr Brown drew attention to the note in the Environment Agency's report that a Quarterly Notification Level associated with pH control had been exceeded during December. Mr Adcock pointed out that the QNL was not a limit but a trigger level to notify the Agency of changes in discharges and help to ensure that limits were not breached. Appropriate action had been taken following this excursion in pH levels.

- 24 Mrs Brown asked why it was necessary to open the waste vaults allowing the possibility of release of radioactivity and consequent health effects. Mr Hughes said it was necessary to retrieve the wastes in the vaults and process them as appropriate for ultimate disposal. He emphasised that the arrangements for the retrieval of the waste would be carefully engineered, controlled and monitored.
- 25 Mrs Brown suggested that the process which had been used for assessing options for the treatment of solid intermediate level waste had been biased in favour of dissolution of the waste. Having regard for the discharges associated with the dissolution process she believed that encapsulation represented a safer alternative. Mr Hughes said that the options assessment process was designed to establish a balanced view of all the associated factors. Cllr Brown and Miss Child, who had also attended the options assessment, believed that the process had been conducted fairly and they were content with the result.
- 26 In response to a question from Cllr Williams, Mr Hughes explained the different types of emergency exercise. Level 1 exercises tested the on-site arrangements, Level 2 exercises tested the off-site plans and Level 3 exercises covered arrangements up to national level.
- 27 In a response to a question from Mr Debenham, Mr Hughes explained the structure of the settling tanks discussed previously; he explained the nature of the work being undertaken to improve the integrity of the secondary containment and monitoring systems.
- 28 Mr Hughes presented a table of planned dates for completion of decommissioning projects. Cllr Short asked that a copy of this table should be circulated with the minutes of this meeting (attached as Appendix 2).
- 29 Ms Yeung provided an update on progress with the mini store project. She said that consideration of the possible use of these storage containers had been ongoing for some two years in response to the NDA's requirement to evaluate existing strategies against new developments in technology. She said that a study had been undertaken last year with stakeholders to examine the proposed use of these containers against a wide range of criteria. As part of that study the various stakeholders had identified the importance they attached to each particular criterion. The outcome of this study had been that the use of mini stores was agreed as the preferred option for the storage of solid and wet intermediate level wastes. Sensitivity analysis had confirmed these results.
- 30 Ms Yeung said it was now necessary to examine the specific circumstances relating to the use of mini stores at individual sites and to give consideration to the nature and volume of wastes on sites and potential discharges associated with processing those wastes. She proposed that a meeting should be held with members of this Group in late April or early May 2010 to examine issues relating to the wastes on the Hinkley Point A site.
- 31 Mr Debenham asked how the volume of a building needed to contain these mini stores would compare with the currently proposed store building.

Ms Yeung said that work was still continuing to identify the number of mini stores which would be required. She said that the mini store containers were robust and provided shielding for the wastes contained inside them. The containment building had to be weatherproof to provide a stable storage environment but did not have to provide the shielding envisaged in the current ILW store design. In response to a further question Ms Yeung said that this type of mini store container had been used in Germany for some 20 years; there were differences between the German and UK regulatory requirements which needed to be considered.

- 32 Mrs Brown asked why it was not possible to leave all wastes undisturbed until a disposal facility was available. Ms Yeung said it was necessary to deal with each type of waste in a timely manner. In the case of some items, such as the reactor structures, it was appropriate to leave them intact and dismantle them later but it would not be appropriate to leave waste in tanks until a disposal facility was available. The treatment depended on the nature of the specific waste material.

EMERGENCY PLANNING CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

- 33 Copies of a report on issues discussed at the most recent meeting of the Emergency Planning Consultative Committee had been made available for members. There were no questions raised by members on the report.

UPDATE FROM SOMERSET NUCLEAR ENERGY GROUP

- 34 Cllr Short said that he had attended a meeting of the Somerset Nuclear Energy Group earlier in the week of this meeting. He said that EDF had reported that the Stage 1 consultation had been completed and they proposed to include their responses to the consultation in the Stage 2 proposals. Views had been expressed that members would prefer to see those responses before the proposals were published. Cllr Short said that discussion at the meeting had also focused upon the long-term storage of irradiated fuel elements on the site.

NII REPORTS

- 35 Reports from the NII Site Inspectors for Hinkley Point A and B had been circulated to members. Cllr Short invited questions from members.
- 36 In response to a question from Mrs Brown, Mr Burrows confirmed that the Nuclear Directorate was vested with statutory authority to close down any operations at the licensed nuclear sites.

REPORT FROM THE ENVIRONMENT AGENCY

- 37 Copies of a report to the Group from the Environment Agency had been circulated to members. There were no questions raised by members on the report.

- 38 Mr McMeekan drew attention to the report on monitoring of radioactivity in food and the environment which had been produced jointly by the Environment Agency, the Food Standards Agency and environmental agencies in Scotland and Northern Ireland. Copies of the report for 2008 were available for members. Cllr Short pointed out that the Food Standards Agency had in previous years sent a representative to present these reports but had said that they did not have the resources to continue to do so. Any questions from members on the information contained in the report could be relayed back to the Food Standards Agency via the Environment Agency representatives.

NDA REPORT

- 39 Dr Warner reported on current NDA issues, drawing particular attention to the following:
- (i) In its budgetary planning process this year the NDA was required to take part in the government's Public Value Programme. Various scenarios which might achieve savings were being considered. These included the deferral of some non-essential work and the possibility of bringing forward some work where a strong business case could be demonstrated.
 - (ii) The NDA's Radioactive Waste Management Directorate had considered the wastes and spent fuel which would arise from the reactor types being considered as part of the new nuclear build programme. It had been concluded that there were no new issues associated with the disposal of those wastes.
 - (iii) The NDA was now publishing a quarterly newsletter on its activities. It was available in printed form and in electronic format via the website.
 - (iv) The NDA had published its overview of integrated waste strategy. An NDA strategy document, scheduled for public consultation in the coming months, would reflect recent changes affecting proposals for the storage of low level wastes on site.
- 40 In response to a question from Cllr Jones, Dr Warner said that funding for decommissioning work at the Magnox sites had been reduced in recent years to give priority to work at other sites eg Sellafield and Dounreay. The programme dates presented earlier by Mr Hughes took account of current funding plans.
- 41 Cllr Edney said it was important that the NDA impressed on government the need for funding for essential safety work. Dr Warner said that safety was given the highest priority; funding issues did not prevent essential safety work being carried out. Mr Phillips drew attention to the implications for the workforce of any decisions to defer decommissioning work. He said it was important to retain a suitably skilled workforce to carry out the work. Dr Warner said that the NDA recognised the need to maintain the necessary

skills. Other related issues included the need for some personnel to move between sites to work on specific projects and the need to consider the scope for the transfer of personnel to work on new power stations.

CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS

- 42 Cllr Short had circulated to members in advance of the meeting a note on current activities and issues. He invited questions from members.
- 43 Mrs Brown commented that the report from Cllr Short referred to the view of Professor Wade Allison that risks arising from radiation had been overstated but had not drawn attention to opposing views which had been published in the Guardian newspaper. Cllr Dr Kellaway-Marriott pointed out that Cllr Short's report did state that "the claims were both supported and opposed by expert comments".

OTHER URGENT BUSINESS

- 44 Cllr Short pointed out that members of the Committee on Radioactive Waste Management were to visit the Hinkley Point A Site on 9 March and had expressed an interest in discussing aspects of the working of this SSG. He said that in his absence Cllr Caswell was to attend the meeting. Cllr Caswell sought from members their views on the effectiveness of the existing SSG arrangements which he could report at the meeting. The comments from members were generally very supportive of the existing arrangements.
- 45 Cllr Short reminded members of the importance of factual accuracy when communicating information to the general public. He referred to a letter from Mrs Brown which had been given wide circulation to press and other media organisations. The letter was responding to comments attributed to Dr Mudd of Bridgwater College in a Guardian newspaper article. Cllr Short said that the letter contained factual errors and invited Mr Hughes to comment on issues raised.
- 46 Mr Hughes referred to the vents which had been installed on the shutdown reactors to allow for changes in atmospheric pressure and temperature. He said that this arrangement had been approved as part of the safety case for the reactors following the removal of fuel. The safety case had been written, independently verified, approved by the Nuclear Safety Committee and the NII. Mr Adcock commented that discharges via these vents, which were an authorised discharge route, represented only a very small proportion of the total discharges from the site. This was confirmed by Mr Withey who pointed out that all discharges were monitored and information on discharges was available on public register.
- 47 Cllr Garner pointed out that the comments in Mrs Brown's letter about the potential contribution of renewable energy sources were unrealistic; it would not be possible to install the amount of plant which would be required and wind energy sources could not be regarded as providing any firm generating capacity. He believed that some nuclear power generation was essential.

Mr Aubrey believed that it would be possible to have an energy supply without nuclear generation, based upon renewables, energy-saving and some fossil-fuelled generation.

- 48 Mrs Brown felt that there should be an epidemiological study to indicate any changes since 2006 when these vents were installed. She felt that without this study it was not possible to claim that there was no effect. Cllr Caswell suggested that if Parents Concerned about Hinkley felt this was appropriate they should fund such a study and present their peer-reviewed results in due course.

DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING

- 48 It was agreed that the next meeting of this Group would be held on Friday 25 June 2010 commencing at 10.00am at the Hinkley Point site.

MJD
4 March 2010

Appendix 1

SSG Sub Group

Mike Short	Chairman – Fiddington
Mike Caswell	Vice Chair – Stockland Bristol
Terry Williams	Kilve Parish
Barbara Child	Co-opted
John Edney	Somerset County Council
Gerald Hudd	Somerset County Council
Jo Brown	PCAH
Mervyn Brown	Otterhampton Parish
Alan Debenham	Stop Hinkley
Dawn Hill	Sedgemoor District Council
Paul Tipney	West Somerset District Council
Anne Fraser	Sedgemoor District Council
Dr Kellaway-Marriott	North Somerset
Chris Morgan	West Somerset District Council

Appendix 2 Table presented at meeting by Mr Hughes (para 28 refers)

Milestone Description	Planned Date	Regulatory Milestone Date
Issue R1 & R2 Ponds Final Fuel Free Verification Report to NII	2010	2010
Completion of Off Site Disposal of Contaminated ACM Thermal Insulation & MMMF	2013	2013
Complete Clean & Drain of R2 Pond	2014	2017
Complete Clean & Drain of R1 Pond	2017	2017
Complete Inactive commissioning of ILW Store	2020	2020
FED Retrieval Active Commissioning Complete	2021	2021
R2 FED Retrieval Operations Completed	2024	2024
Complete Wet Intermediate Level Waste Recovery & Treatment	2026	
Pile cap refuelling machines, hole prep & filling	2027	
Major volume blowdown filters	2027	
CO2 Blowdown Stack	2027	
By-pass filters and driers	2027	
Emergency blowdown carbon filters	2027	
Rinners (rinsers)	2027	
Gas ducts including bypass systems	2027	
Complete Phase 3 Care & Maintenance Preps	2030	2032
Complete Hinkley Point 'A' Phase 5' Approved End State Achieved	2090	2106
Complete FSC Site Landscaping		